

# Exhibit 1

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000023242	HTM	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Central Intake Threshold Analysis.html	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000033701	HTM	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	FW_FW_[External] Center for States Assistance with CFSR PIP Activities.html	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to external supports for improving compliance with PIP.
CTRL0000052543	MSG	8/27/2019 14:38	Henson, Kevin M	Linda Watts (Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov) [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]; Cole, Janie M [Janie.M.Cole@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W (Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov) [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov];	FW: [External] Center for States Assistance with CFSR PIP Activities	000000008188A764220B584B830328F989DEA5D604152100.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000052543.0001	VCF	N/A	N/A	N/A	Kevin M. Henson	Kevin M_Henson.vcf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000056025	MSG	10/17/2019 16:24	Henson, Kevin M	McCallister, Jane B [Jane.B.McCallister@wv.gov];	CI Screening	000000008188A764220B584B830328F989DEA5D604D62A00.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0000056 025.0001	VCF	N/A	N/A	N/A	Kevin M. Henson	Kevin M_ Henson.vcf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000056 025.0002	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Centralized Intake July 2019 through October 2019.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000056 189	MSG	11/5/2019 9:44	Henson, Kevin M	McCallister, Jane B [Jane.B.McCallister@wv.gov]; Scarberry, Laura J [Laura.J.Scarberry@wv.gov]; Littlefield, Kellie M [Kellie.M.Littlefield@wv.gov]; Moore, Cindy E [Cindy.E.Moore@wv.gov];	FW: QRTP Memo	000000008188A764220B584B830328F989DEA5D6445A2B00.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000056 189.0001	DOC	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	QRTP Supplemental Memo 11-5-19.doc	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0000056 189.0002	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	FFPSA-QRTP Locations Map- 10-24-19.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000056 189.0003	VCF	N/A	N/A	N/A	Kevin M. Henson	Kevin M_ Henson.vcf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000056 262	MSG	10/31/2019 14:21	Henson, Kevin M	Scarberry, Laura J [Laura.J.Scarberry@wv.gov];	Central Intake Threshold Analysis	000000008188A7 64220B584B830 328F989DEA5D 6E48B2B00.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000056 262.0001	VCF	N/A	N/A	N/A	Kevin M. Henson	Kevin M_ Henson.vcf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000056 910	MSG	11/8/2019 11:39	Scarberry, Laura J [Laura.J.Scarberry@wv.gov]	Henson, Kevin M [Kevin.M.Henson@wv.gov];	RE: Central Intake Threshold Analysis	000000008188A7 64220B584B830 328F989DEA5D 624872A00.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0000161447	MSG	5/15/2019 15:40	Henson, Kevin M [Kevin.M.Henson@wv.gov]	Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]; Cole, Janie M [Janie.M.Cole@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Hymes, Amy L [Amy.L.Hymes@wv.gov]; Richards, Susan M [Susan.M.Richards@wv.gov]; Weekley, Jim K [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov]; Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]; McCallister, Jane B [Jane.B.McCallister@wv.gov]; Larew, Rhonda G [Rhonda.G.Larew@wv.gov]; Scarberry, Laura J [Laura.J.Scarberry@wv.gov]; Littlefield, Kellie M [Kellie.M.Littlefield@wv.gov]; McIntire, Alicia R [Alicia.R.McIntire@wv.gov]	Comment Period on AFCARS proposed rule changes.	000000004DFC686D0AFDDE49805FA0772116405104312000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to strategic submission of comment on proposed rule to HHS.
CTRL0000161447.0001	VCF	N/A	N/A	N/A	Kevin M. Henson	Kevin M_Henson.vcf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to strategic submission of comment on proposed rule to HHS.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000161447.0002	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	FR 04-19-2019 AFCARS NPRM.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to strategic submission of comment on proposed rule to HHS.
CTRL0000161447.0003	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	AFCARS Proposed Rule Changes.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to strategic submission of comment on proposed rule to HHS.
CTRL0000213991	MSG	11/28/2022 11:56	Grogg, Heather M [heather.m.grogg@wv.gov]	Beverly J Metz [beverly.j.metz@wv.gov];	Fwd: Assignments for Crisis	00000000F0BF5CBDE8E55642BE4B20CDD039A31F84862000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0000213 991.0001	CSV	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	InvestigationWor kload Hill.csv	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000214 326	MSG	11/18/2022 11:43	Grogg, Heather M [heather.m.grogg@wv.gov]	Mindy L Cranmer [mindy.l.cranmer@wv.gov];	Class Specifications on Jobs	00000000F0BF5 CBDE8E55642B E4B20CDD039A 31F84B02000.M SG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000214 326.0001	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Class specs.pdf	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000244 589	MSG	11/5/2019 9:44	Henson, Kevin M [Kevin.M.Henson@wv.gov]	McCallister, Jane B [Jane.B.McCallister@wv.gov]; Scarberry, Laura J [Laura.J.Scarberry@wv.gov]; Littlefield, Kellie M [Kellie.M.Littlefield@wv.gov]; Moore, Cindy E [Cindy.E.Moore@wv.gov];	FW: QRTP Memo	0000000047AE7 4863577E1448F2 96A4914DC39D C84F02000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000244 589.0001	DOC	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	QRTP Supplemental Memo 11-5- 19.doc	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0000244 589.0002	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	FFPSA-QRTP Locations Map- 10-24-19.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000244 589.0003	VCF	N/A	N/A	N/A	Kevin M. Henson	Kevin M_ Henson.vcf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000274 330	MSG	8/16/2023 7:19	Young, Sherri A [sherri.a.young@wv.gov]	Persily, Cynthia A [cynthia.a.persily@wv.gov]; Beth Jarrett [beth.jarrett@wv.gov]; Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Michael J Caruso [michael.j.caruso@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Starlah A Wilcox [starlah.a.wilcox@wv.gov]	Re: Information to be discussed at our Budget Meeting tomorrow at noon	000000007CA25 543D97ABA429 D10F53D7B9572 CC44512000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of budget for Secretaries' offices.

Jonathan R., et al., v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000274 331	MSG	8/16/2023 7:16	Persily, Cynthia A [cynthia.a.persily@wv.gov]	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Beth Jarrett [beth.jarrett@wv.gov]; Michael J Caruso [michael.j.caruso@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Sherri A Young [sherri.a.young@wv.gov]; Starlah A Wilcox [starlah.a.wilcox@wv.gov]	Re: Information to be discussed at our Budget Meeting tomorrow at noon	000000007CA25 543D97ABA429 D10F53D7B9572 CC64512000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of budget for Secretaries' offices.
CTRL0000275 046	MSG	8/1/2023 9:23	Persily, Cynthia A [cynthia.a.persily@wv.gov]	No Reply [d+noreply@docs.google.com];	Re: Department of Human Services Brand Charter	000000007CA25 543D97ABA429 D10F53D7B9572 CCE4AA2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0000282584	MSG	5/21/2020 11:23	Scarberry, Laura J [Laura.J.Scarberry@wv.gov]	Henson, Kevin M [Kevin.M.Henson@wv.gov];	RE: Survey	00000000CE5346B00C18384AB48CF3AADD86D521447B2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of survey querying BCF's response to COVID.
CTRL0000282584.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Covid-19 SurveyREV.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of survey querying BCF's response to COVID.
CTRL0000284304	MSG	10/31/2019 14:21	Henson, Kevin M [Kevin.M.Henson@wv.gov]	Scarberry, Laura J [Laura.J.Scarberry@wv.gov];	Central Intake Threshold Analysis	0000000000059CD9395F8E4C9EE156A27519B5C4E4192000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000284304.0001	VCF	N/A	N/A	N/A	Kevin M. Henson	Kevin M_Henson.vcf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000285614	MSG	11/8/2019 11:39	Scarberry, Laura J [Laura.J.Scarberry@wv.gov]	Henson, Kevin M [Kevin.M.Henson@wv.gov];	RE: Central Intake Threshold Analysis	0000000000059CD9395F8E4C9EE156A27519B5C444E92000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000345457	MSG	2/1/2021 10:07	McIntire, Alicia R [Alicia.R.McIntire@wv.gov]	Richards, Tony J [Tony.J.Richards@wv.gov]; Hymes, Amy L [Amy.L.Hymes@wv.gov];	Program Instruction	00000000D115079FF36FC446903064D1F7D5623C246A2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.



CTRL0000345457.0001	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	ACYF-CB-IM-21-05 stimulus bill.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000350935	MSG	8/26/2021 12:06	Bragg, Lorie L [lorie.l.bragg@wv.gov]	Fortney, Christie A [christie.a.fortney@wv.gov]; Hymes, Amy L [amy.l.hymes@wv.gov]	Re: residential placement issue	0000000023255C BDA4631E49BA D626A31824A7 DEC48B2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to placing children.
CTRL0000350948	MSG	8/26/2021 9:18	Fortney, Christie A [christie.a.fortney@wv.gov]	Bragg, Lorie L [lorie.l.bragg@wv.gov]; Hymes, Amy L [amy.l.hymes@wv.gov]	Re: residential placement issue	0000000023255C BDA4631E49BA D626A31824A7 DEA48D2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000381757	MSG	5/25/2022 15:42	Cosenza, Susan C [susan.c.cosenza@wv.gov]	Amber J Shoemaker [amber.j.shoemaker@wv.gov]; Cree H Lemasters [cree.h.lemasters@wv.gov]; Nancy D Ritchie [nancy.d.ritchie@wv.gov]	Transcripts for DOP for John Ramos	000000009B280 B8E34048B4A99 C38688310312F E247C2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000381757.0001	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Ramos college of So. Maryland transcripts.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000381 757.0002	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Ramos Shepherd transcripts.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000394 562	MSG	3/30/2023 16:04	White, Donna K [donna.k.white@wv.gov]	Queen, Amanda D [amanda.d.queen@wv.gov]; Pack, Jeffrey M [jeffrey.m.pack@wv.gov]; La urea J Ellis [Laurea.J.Ellis@wv.gov]	Re: DHHR Application	0000000098CA3 545C3ADD04DA 82DF665790AE8 7624302100.MS G	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000394 562.0001	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SKM_550i17121 909550.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000394 562.0002	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SKM_550i17121 909551.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000394 562.0003	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SKM_550i17121 910060.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000398829	MSG	6/14/2023 11:12	Weekley, Jim K [jim.k.weekley@wv.gov]	Jeffrey M Pack [jeffrey.m.pack@wv.gov]; Rebecca D Carson [rebecah.d.carson@wv.gov]; Mary T Rossana [mary.t.rossana@wv.gov]; Christie B Spahr [christie.b.spahr@wv.gov]	Fwd: BUMFS Home Finding budget	00000000D2D0EBA3C710134397A8AFA0A27C3BD44A32000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000398829.0001	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	homefinding salary.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000424428	MSG	4/7/2021 13:23	Samples, Jeremiah [Jeremiah.Samples@wv.gov]	Amjad, Ayne [Ayne.Amjad@wv.gov];	RE: BerryDunn Contracts and Invoices	000000002EE02C5DF4133F45A1CD9E1BE41836F0A46A2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to potential ending of relationship with vendor.
CTRL0000424790	MSG	4/13/2021 12:20	Haynes, Donnie W [Donnie.W.Haynes@wv.gov]	Samples, Jeremiah [Jeremiah.Samples@wv.gov]; Priddy, Timothy J [Timothy.J.Priddy@wv.gov];	RE: Emergency Management Regions	000000002EE02C5DF4133F45A1CD9E1BE41836F0A4982000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000424790.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Liaison Map.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000424827	MSG	4/7/2021 12:11	Amjad, Ayne [Ayne.Amjad@wv.gov];	Samples, Jeremiah [Jeremiah.Samples@wv.gov];	FW: BerryDunn Contracts and Invoices	000000002EE02C5DF4133F45A1CD9E1BE41836F0449D2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000424 827.0001	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	BPH BerryDunn Contracts & Invoice Payments.xlsx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000445 782	MSG	8/12/2021 7:15	Samples, Jeremiah [jeremiah.samples@wv.gov]	Pack, Jeffrey M [jeffrey.m.pack@wv.gov];	Re: CPS Worker Trauma	0000000001A253 3B5A935E4CB2 BD7543EE6243B E24942000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000445 783	MSG	8/12/2021 6:49	Pack, Jeffrey M [jeffrey.m.pack@wv.gov]	Samples, Jeremiah [jeremiah.samples@wv.gov];	Re: CPS Worker Trauma	0000000001A253 3B5A935E4CB2 BD7543EE6243B E44942000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Meeting notes reflecting internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of RFP.
CTRL0000445 784	MSG	8/12/2021 6:43	Samples, Jeremiah [jeremiah.samples@wv.gov]	Pack, Jeffrey M [jeffrey.m.pack@wv.gov];	Re: CPS Worker Trauma	0000000001A253 3B5A935E4CB2 BD7543EE6243B E64942000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000460 836	MSG	3/11/2021 14:45	Bates, Rae J [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]	Keefer, Matthew C [Matthew.C.Keefer@wv.gov]; Crouch, Bill J [Bill.J.Crouch@wv.gov]; Lusk, Shevona R [Shevona.R.Lusk@wv.gov]	FW: Resident matrix (CMS 802) reports	00000000062A25 E0C8C62C47840 35EC049E6278B 84BD2000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000460 836.0001	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Withdraw 802.xlsx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000460 836.0002	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Lakin Hospital 802.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000460 836.0003	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Hopemont 802.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000460 836.0004	XLS	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Manchin 802.xls	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000473 496	MSG	7/27/2022 9:29	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 08048E2200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000473497	MSG	7/27/2022 9:27	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]; Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	000000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 08248E2200.MS G	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473499	MSG	7/27/2022 9:19	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	000000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 08648E2200.MS G	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473500	MSG	7/27/2022 9:16	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]; Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	000000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 08848E2200.MS G	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000473501	MSG	7/27/2022 9:15	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 08A48E2200.MS G	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473502	MSG	7/27/2022 9:06	Ferris, Angela L [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]; Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 08C48E2200.MS G	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473531	MSG	7/26/2022 18:54	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]; Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0864922200.MS G	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000473 653	MSG	7/25/2022 9:23	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]	Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]; Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov];Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov];Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov];Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov];Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov];Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov];Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 08A4A12200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473 658	MSG	7/25/2022 8:35	Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov];Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov];Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov];Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov];Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov];Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov];Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0844A22200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473 704	MSG	7/22/2022 16:16	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]	Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]; Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov];Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov];Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov];Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov];Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov];Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov];Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0804A82200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description



CTRL0000473705	MSG	7/22/2022 15:43	Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov];Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov] ;Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov];Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov];Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov];Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov];Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	000000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0824A82200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473706	MSG	7/22/2022 15:42	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov];Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov];Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov] ;Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov];Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov];Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov];Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov];Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	000000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0844A82200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473778	MSG	7/21/2022 18:21	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov];Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov];Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov] ;Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov];Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov];Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov];Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov];Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	000000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0844B12200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000473779	MSG	7/21/2022 18:19	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]; Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov];Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov];Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov];Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov];Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov];Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	000000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0864B12200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473785	MSG	7/21/2022 16:07	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov];Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov];Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov];Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov];Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov];Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov];Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	000000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0824B22200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473787	MSG	7/21/2022 15:53	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]; Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov];Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov];Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov];Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov];Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov];Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	000000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0864B22200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000473788	MSG	7/21/2022 15:46	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Priddy, Cecil N [cecil.n.pridy@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	000000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0884B22200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473789	MSG	7/21/2022 15:45	Ferris, Angela L [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]; Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Priddy, Cecil N [cecil.n.pridy@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	000000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 08A4B22200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473790	MSG	7/21/2022 15:44	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]; Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Priddy, Cecil N [cecil.n.pridy@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	000000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 08C4B22200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000473791	MSG	7/21/2022 15:41	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 08E4B22200.MS G	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473792	MSG	7/21/2022 15:38	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]; Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0804B32200.MS G	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473870	MSG	7/21/2022 12:28	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]; Tara L Buckner [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0844BD2200.MS G	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000473884	MSG	7/21/2022 10:08	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	000000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0804BF2200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000473886	MSG	7/21/2022 10:04	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	000000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0844BF2200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473888	MSG	7/21/2022 10:01	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	000000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0884BF2200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000473 900	MSG	7/21/2022 9:19	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0804C12200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of FTE position.
CTRL0000473 901	MSG	7/21/2022 9:15	Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0824C12200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of FTE position.
CTRL0000473 913	MSG	7/21/2022 8:26	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]; Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 08A4C22200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of FTE position.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000473 936	MSG	7/20/2022 20:21	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]	Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov];Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov] ;Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov];Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov];Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov];Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov];Tara L Buckner [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	000000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0884C52200.MS G	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473 937	MSG	7/20/2022 20:13	Lillard, Colleen M [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov];Tara L Buckner [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov];Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov] ;Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov];Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov];Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov];Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov];Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	000000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 08A4C52200.MS G	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473 945	MSG	7/20/2022 16:20	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]	Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Tara L Buckner [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov];Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov] ;Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov];Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov];Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov];Colleen M Lillard [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov];Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov];Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	000000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 08A4C62200.MS G	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473 946	MSG	7/20/2022 16:18	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]	Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov];Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov] ;Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov];Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov];Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov];Colleen M Lillard [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov];Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	000000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 08C4C62200.MS G	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.

Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000473 947	MSG	7/20/2022 16:17	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]	Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]; Colleen M Lillard [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 08E4C62200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473 948	MSG	7/20/2022 16:02	Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]	Tara L Buckner [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]; Colleen M Lillard [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0804C72200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473 949	MSG	7/20/2022 15:56	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]	Bates, Rae J [rac.j.bates@wv.gov]; Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0824C72200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473 950	MSG	7/20/2022 15:53	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]	Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]; Colleen M Lillard [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0844C72200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description



CTRL0000473 951	MSG	7/20/2022 15:43	Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]; Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]; Colleen M Lillard [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0864C72200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473 952	MSG	7/20/2022 15:33	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]	Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]; Colleen M Lillard [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0884C72200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473 954	MSG	7/20/2022 15:21	Pritt, Cecil N [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]	Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]; Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]; Colleen M Lillard [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 08C4C72200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473 957	MSG	7/20/2022 14:41	Bates, Rae J [rae.j.bates@wv.gov]	Ginny L Fitzwater [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov];	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 0844C82200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.
CTRL0000473 960	MSG	7/20/2022 14:15	Lusk, Shevona R [shevona.r.lusk@wv.gov]	Snyder, John M [john.m.snyder@wv.gov]; Rae J Bates [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Fitzwater, Ginny L [ginny.l.fitzwater@wv.gov]; Ryan, Patrick W [patrick.w.ryan@wv.gov]; Cecil N Pritt [cecil.n.pritt@wv.gov]; Colleen M Lillard [colleen.m.lillard@wv.gov]; Angela L Ferris [angela.l.ferris@wv.gov]; Huddleston, Lynn [lynn.m.huddleston@wv.gov]	Re: Follow-up from forensic call on 7/19	00000000B8FC CA89DE4FB499 99EB1F9088874 08A4C82200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about agency assignment of FTE positions.

Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000478486	MSG	6/22/2021 16:22	Adler, Allison C [Allison.C.Alder@wv.gov]	Jarrett, Beth [Beth.Jarrett@wv.gov]; Bates, Rae J [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]; Crouch, Bill J [Bill.J.Crouch@wv.gov]	add to Secretary's calendar, if time	00000000E6024064A08DE7498AD2CB91842734E264F62100.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000478486.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	6.24.21 Medical Cannabis Advisory Board Meeting Agenda .docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000537961	MSG	8/22/2019 9:46	Carson, Rebekah D [Rebekah.D.Carson@wv.gov]	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov];	RE: critical incident Bleigh Nichols	0000000053DA2DBF5468C94AA77D4DCAA32EA6B804012100.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to DHHR policy change.
CTRL0000543248	MSG	12/20/2019 8:38	Carson, Rebekah D [Rebekah.D.Carson@wv.gov]	Bleigh, Sarah I [Sarah.I.Bleigh@wv.gov];	FW: Monitoring Reports - Nicole	00000000507FAAF2E983141B482FD305AB998BEE4F02000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000543248.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Nicole 1.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000543248.0002	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Nicole 2.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000543 248.0003	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Nicole 3.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000543 268	MSG	12/18/2019 16:50	Burnoski, Kiara D [Kiara.D.Burnoski@wv.gov]	Carson, Rebecah D [Rebecah.D.Carson@wv.gov];	Monitoring Reports Nicole	00000000507FA AAF2E983141B4 82FD305AB998 -BE64F32000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000543 268.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Nicole 1.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000543 268.0002	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Nicole 2.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000543 268.0003	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Nicole 3.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000547541	MSG	5/1/2020 11:54	Mullins, Christina R. [Christina.R.Mullins@wv.gov]	Melinda Trail [mtrail@berrydunn.com]; Kirsten Bickford [kbickford@berrydunn.com]; Peter Alfrey [PALfrey@berrydunn.com]; Jason Hargrove [jhargrove@berrydunn.com]; Julie Sullivan [jsullivan@berrydunn.com]; Charlie Leadbetter [cleadbetter@berrydunn.com]; Nicole Becnel [nbecnel@berrydunn.com]; Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov];	RE: COVID-19 Contact Tracing - Timeline, Scope, and Project Structure Discussion	000000007AC3B1864C25F045A76C4A09327C51A004622000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional comments deliberating development of contact tracing strategic plan.
CTRL0000547541.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Contact Tracing Strategic Plan DRAFT.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional comments deliberating development of contact tracing strategic plan.
CTRL0000547560	MSG	6/10/2020 11:32	Shelly Schram [sschram@berrydunn.com]	Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]; Shaun.L.Charles@wv.gov; Suzanne.P.Lopez@wv.gov; Robert.L.Phillips@wv.gov; Scott Young [syounge@berrydunn.com]; Jamie Brennan [jbrennan@berrydunn.com]	[External] Production Data Request Meeting Notes from 6/4/2020 and 6/5/2020	000000007AC3B1864C25F045A76C4A09327C51A064642000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to meeting notes reflecting internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of PATH.
CTRL0000547560.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	2020605_Production_Data_Request_Notes.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Meeting notes reflecting internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of PATH.
CTRL0000547560.0002	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	2020604_Production_Data_Request_Notes.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to meeting notes reflecting internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of PATH.
CTRL0000547586	MSG	5/7/2020 17:18	Kirsten Bickford [kbickford@berrydunn.com]	Mullins, Christina R [Christina.R.Mullins@wv.gov]; Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]; Frazer, Stephanie D [Stephanie.D.Frazer@wv.gov]; Hunt, Laura N [Laura.N.Hunt@wv.gov]; Nicole Becnel [nbecnel@berrydunn.com]; Peter Alfrey [PALfrey@berrydunn.com]; Julie Sullivan [jsullivan@berrydunn.com]; Melinda Trail [mtrail@berrydunn.com]; Jason Hargrove [jhargrove@berrydunn.com]	[External] Documents for Contact Tracing (5/7/2020 Update)	000000007AC3B1864C25F045A76C4A09327C51A0E4672000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000547586.0001	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200507_Contact_Tracing_Organizational_Structure_DRAFT.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000547 586.0002	PPTX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200507_Contact_Tracing_Organizational_Structure_DRAFT.pptx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000547 586.0003	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200507_DHHR Contact_Tracing_Volunteer_Letter_DRAFT.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000547 586.0004	VSDX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200507_Contact_Tracing_Organizational_Structure_DRAFT.vsd	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000547 586.0005	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200507_CCTI DHHR Employee Volunteer Form_DRAFT.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000547 586.0006	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200507_CCTI Vendor_Comparison_Chart.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								

Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000547586.0007	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200507_Contact_Tracing_Resource_Tool_DRAFT_v6.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000547875	MSG	5/1/2020 10:09	Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]	Nicole Becnel [nbecnel@berrydunn.com];	FW: Contact Tracing Strategic Plan DRAFT	000000007AC3B1864C25F045A76C4A09327C51A0248C2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000547875.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Contact Tracing Strategic Plan DRAFT.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000547877	MSG	5/1/2020 9:46	Mullins, Christina R [Christina.R.Mullins@wv.gov]	Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov];	Contact Tracing Strategic Plan DRAFT	000000007AC3B1864C25F045A76C4A09327C51A0648C2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000547877.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Contact Tracing Strategic Plan DRAFT.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000547889	MSG	4/30/2020 20:26	Atkins, Amy D [Amy.D.Atkins@wv.gov]	Cottrill, Logan R CPT USARMY NG WVARNG (USA) [logan.r.cottrill2.mil@mail.mil]; Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]; Lisa Costello [costello.lisa@gmail.com]; Mullins, Christina R [Christina.R.Mullins@wv.gov]; Charles, Shaun L [Shaun.L.Charles@wv.gov];	FW: Call with CDC Innovative Technologies Team to discuss technology platforms	000000007AC3B1864C25F045A76C4A09327C51A0E48D2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000547889.0001	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	State Contact Tracing Summary 4_30_2020.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000547891	MSG	4/30/2020 21:45	Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]	Nicole Becnel [nbecnel@berrydunn.com];	Fwd: Call with CDC Innovative Technologies Team to discuss technology platforms	000000007AC3B1864C25F045A76C4A09327C51A0248E2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000547891.0001	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	State Contact Tracing Summary 4_30_2020.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000547891.0002	HTM	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	ATT00001.htm	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000547 965	MSG	5/18/2020 8:22	Mo Maitland [mmaitland@berrydunn.com]	Jamie Brennan [jbrennan@berrydunn.com]; Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]; Dill on, Jason I [Jason.I.Dillon@wv.gov]; Gil pin, Tom [tegilpin@hsc.wvu.edu]; Duval, Robert [Robert.Duval@hsc.wvu.edu] ; Jones, Amanda [aajones@hsc.wvu.edu]; Nico lle Field [nfield@berrydunn.com]; Nor a Gilligan [NGilligan@berrydunn.com]; Ruth Ferris [rferris@berrydunn.com]; Crystal Gray [cgray@berrydunn.com]; Mar ilyn Lorenzo [mlorenzo@innovativemgmt.com]; Angie Davis [adavis@innovativemgmt.com]; Lindsey Morgan [lindsey@advikit.com]	[External] 20200513 Monthly WV IES IV&V Certification and Compliance Meeting Notes	000000007AC3B 1864C25F045A7 6C4A09327C51A 084972000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000547 965.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200513_Monthly_WV_IES_IVV_Cert_Comp_Notes.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000547 967	MSG	5/18/2020 8:39	Mo Maitland [mmaitland@berrydunn.com]	Jamie Brennan [jbrennan@berrydunn.com]; Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]; Dill on, Jason I [Jason.I.Dillon@wv.gov]; Gil pin, Tom [tegilpin@hsc.wvu.edu]; Duval, Robert [Robert.Duval@hsc.wvu.edu] ; Jones, Amanda [aajones@hsc.wvu.edu]; Nico lle Field [nfield@berrydunn.com]; Nor a Gilligan [NGilligan@berrydunn.com]; Ruth Ferris [rferris@berrydunn.com]; Crystal Gray [cgray@berrydunn.com]	[External] 20200513 Monthly WV IES IV&V Certification and Compliance Meeting Notes	000000007AC3B 1864C25F045A7 6C4A09327C51A 0C4972000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000547 967.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200513_Monthly_WV_IES_IVV_Cert_Comp_Notes.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.



Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000548254	MSG	5/8/2020 16:45	Kirsten Bickford [kbickford@berrydunn.com]	Mullins, Christina R [Christina.R.Mullins@wv.gov]; Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]; Frazer, Stephanie D [Stephanie.D.Frazer@wv.gov]; Hunt, Laura N [Laura.N.Hunt@wv.gov]; Nicole Becnel [nbecnel@berrydunn.com]; Peter Alfrey [PALfrey@berrydunn.com]; Julie Sullivan [jsullivan@berrydunn.com]; Melinda Trail [mtrail@berrydunn.com]; Jason Hargrove [jhargrove@berrydunn.com]	[External] Documents for Contact Tracing (5/8/2020 Update)	000000007AC3B1864C25F045A76C4A09327C51A044BC2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000548254.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_CCTI DHHR Employee Volunteer Form_DRAFT.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000548254.0002	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_Contact_Tracing_Organizational_Structure_DRAFT.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000548254.0003	VSDX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_Contact_Tracing_Organizational_Structure_DRAFT.vsd	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0000548 254.0004	PPTX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_Contract_Tracing_Organizational_Structure_DRAFT.pptx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
-------------------------	------	-----	-----	-----	-----	---	--------------------------------	---

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000548 254.0005	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_CCTI_Vendor_Comparison_Chart.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000548 254.0006	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_Contract_Tracing_DRAFT_v6.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000548 254.0007	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_Contract_Tracing_Job_Description_DRAFT.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000548 254.0008	PPTX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_CCTI_Timeline_DRAFT.pptx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0000548 254.0009	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_CCTI _Timeline_DRAFT.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
-------------------------	------	-----	-----	-----	-----	---------------------------------------	--------------------------------------	---

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000548 254.0010	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_Contact Tracing Strategic Plan_DRAFT.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000548 256	MSG	5/8/2020 16:52	Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]	Kirsten Bickford [kbickford@berrydunn.com]; Mullins, Christina R [Christina.R.Mullins@wv.gov]; Frazer, Stephanie D [Stephanie.D.Frazer@wv.gov]; Hunt, Laura N [Laura.N.Hunt@wv.gov]; Nicole Becnel [nbecnel@berrydunn.com]; Peter Alfrey [PALfrey@berrydunn.com]; Julie Sullivan [jsullivan@berrydunn.com]; Melinda Trail [mtrail@berrydunn.com]; Jason Hargrove [jhargrove@berrydunn.com]	RE: [External] Documents for Contact Tracing (5/8/2020 Update)	000000007AC3B1864C25F045A76C4A09327C51A084BC2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000548 256.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_CCTI DHHR Employee Volunteer Form_DRAFT.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0000548 256.0002	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_Contract_Tracing_Organizational_Structure_DRAFT.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000548 256.0003	VSDX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_Contract_Tracing_Organizational_Structure_DRAFT.vsd	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000548 256.0004	PPTX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_Contract_Tracing_Organizational_Structure_DRAFT.pptx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000548 256.0005	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_CCTI_Vendor_Comparison_Chart.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000548 256.0006	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_Contract_Tracing_DRAFT_v6.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0000548 256.0007	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_Contract Tracing_Job Description_DRAFT.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000548 256.0008	PPTX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_CCTI_Timeline_DRAFT.pptx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000548 256.0009	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_CCTI_Timeline_DRAFT.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000548 256.0010	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200508_Contract Tracing Strategic Plan_DRAFT.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000548 471	MSG	5/28/2020 19:14	Jason Hargrove [jhargrove@berrydunn.com]	Mullins, Christina R [Christina.R.Mullins@wv.gov]; Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]; Charles, Shaun L [Shaun.L.Charles@wv.gov]; Kirsten Bickford [kbickford@berrydunn.com]; Julie Sullivan [jsullivan@berrydunn.com]; Peter Alfrey [PAlfrey@berrydunn.com]	[External] Contact Tracing Progress and Priorities May 28 2020	000000007AC3B1864C25F045A76C4A09327C51A0C4D72000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing program.

CTRL0000548 471.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200528_WV_Contact Tracing_State_Re search.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing program.
CTRL0000548 471.0002	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200528_Conta ct_Tracing_Reso urce_Estimating_ Tool_ACTIVE_v 12.xlsx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing program.
CTRL0000548 575	MSG	4/28/2020 16:58	Mo Maitland [mmaitland@berrydunn.com]	Crystal Gray [cgray@berrydunn.com]; Lopez, Suzanne P [Suzanne.P.Lopez@wv.gov]; Jamie Brennan [jbrennan@berrydunn.com]; Nora Gilligan [NGilligan@berrydunn.com]; Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]; Kat Lawrence (Consulting) [katheryne.lawrence@berrydunn.com]; Scott Twigg [stwigg@berrydunn.com]; Scott Young [syoun@berrydunn.com]	[External] 20200424 Final DHHR Work Session: FNS Mapping Workbook (Security) Meeting Notes	000000007AC3B 1864C25F045A7 6C4A09327C51A 0C4E42000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al., v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000548 575.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200424_FNS Security_Criteria _Mapping_Meeti ng_Notes.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000548 641	MSG	4/27/2020 12:29	Lewis, Catherine B [Catherine.B .Lewis@wv.gov]	Julie Sullivan [jsullivan@berrydunn.com]; Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]; ssta cki@berrydunn.com; lhill@be rrydunn.com; Mason, Lindsey J [Lindsey.J.Mason@wv.gov]	Contact tracing documents	000000007AC3B 1864C25F045A7 6C4A09327C51A 024ED2000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000548 641.0001	PPTX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	DHHR BPH_PowerPoint COVID-19 Contact tracing.pptx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing program.
CTRL0000548 641.0002	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Contact Tracing Form FINAL.pdf	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing program.
CTRL0000548 641.0003	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Contact Tracing infographic APPROVED - Copy.pdf	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing program.

CTRL0000548 926	MSG	5/6/2020 16:14	Kirsten Bickford [kbickford@ berrydunn.co m]	Mullins, Christina R [Christina.R.Mullins@wv.go v]; Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]; Fra zer, Stephanie D [Stephanie.D.Frazer@wv.gov ]; Hunt, Laura N [Laura.N.Hunt@wv.gov]; Nicole Becnel [nbecnel@berrydunn.com]; Pe ter Alfrey [PALfrey@berrydunn.com]; Ju lie Sullivan [jsullivan@berrydunn.com]; Melinda Trail [mtrail@berrydunn.com]	RE: Documents for Contact Tracing	00000000DE975 9CA1CC590408 CC7E6DBADD8 7D9804042000. MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing program.
CTRL0000548 926.0001	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200506_Conta ct_Tracing_Organ izational_Structur e_DRAFT.pdf	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing program.
CTRL0000548 926.0002	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Contact Tracing_Job Description_2020 0506_DRAFT.do cx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing program.
CTRL0000548 926.0003	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Deputy_Secretary _Jeremiah_Sampl es_Contact_Traci ng_Volunteer_Let ter_DRAFT_202 00506.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing program.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000548 926.0004	VSDX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200506_Conta ct_Tracing_Organ izational_Structur e_DRAFT.vsd	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing program.
CTRL0000548 926.0005	PPTX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200506_Conta ct_Tracing_Organ izational_Structur e_DRAFT.pptx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing program.
CTRL0000548 926.0006	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200506 CCTI DHHR Employee Volunteer Form_DRAFT.do cx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing program.
CTRL0000548 926.0007	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200506 CCTI _Vendor_Compar ison_Chart.xlsx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing program.
CTRL0000549 012	MSG	5/5/2020 10:34	Julie Sullivan [jsullivan@b errydunn.co m]	Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]; Mullins, Christina R [Christina.R.Mullins@wv.go v]; Kirsten Bickford [kbickford@berrydunn.com]; Peter Alfrey [PALfrey@berrydunn.com]	[External] Technology memo, work flows, and CDC's 50-state tech snapshot	00000000DE975 9CA1CC590408 CC7E6DBADD8 7D98C40E2000. MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0000549 012.0001	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	State Contact Tracing Summary 4_30_2020.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000549 012.0002	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200501 COVID-19 Investigation - CT.V4.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000549 012.0003	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200428 COVID-19 Technology Memo - REDCap.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000549 246	MSG	5/1/2020 17:08	Mullins, Christina R [Christina.R.Mullins@wv.gov]	Crouch, Bill J [Bill.J.Crouch@wv.gov];Slemp, Cathy C [Cathy.C.Slemp@wv.gov];Samples, Jeremiah [Jeremiah.Samples@wv.gov]; Atkins, Amy D [Amy.D.Atkins@wv.gov];Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]	Internal and Deliberative Draft Contract Tracing Plan	00000000DE9759CA1CC590408CC7E6DBADD87D98242C2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing program.
CTRL0000549 246.0001	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Contract Tracing Budget Draft.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing program.
CTRL0000549 246.0002	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200501_Contract Tracing Strategic Plan 5PM.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing program.



CTRL0000549 277	MSG	3/31/2020 12:44	Lawrence, Tammy J [Tammy.J.La wrence@wv. gov]	[mudson@berrydunn.com]; Vincent, Patricia A [Patricia.A.Vincent@wv.gov] ;Skuzza, Sally [sally.skuzza@optum.com];Je annette McGee [jeannette.evans@optum.com ]; WVIES Action Items [WVIESactionitems@berryd unn.com];WVIES_Action_It ems [wvies_ai@optum.com];Dillo n, Jason I [Jason.I.Dillon@wv.gov];Da vis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov];Ric hard Moore [rkmoore@berrydunn.com]; McIntire, Alicia R [Alicia.R.McIntire@wv.gov]; Dean, Traci A [Traci.A.Dean@wv.gov];Mer cer, Lesa D [Les.D.Mercer@wv.gov];Ur quhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.go v];Miller, Terri S	RE: [External] CW Action Items - Week Ending 4/3/2020 CW-122	00000000DE975 9CA1CC590408 CC7E6DBADD8 7D9804302000. MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
--------------------	-----	-----------------	---	---	---	--	--	---

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000549 277.0001	EML	3/6/2020 16:32	Lawrence, Tammy J [Tammy.J.La wrence@wv. gov]	Jones, Staci R [Staci.R.Jones@wv.gov];Hop pe, Jacquelyn P [Jacquelyn.P.Hoppe@wv.gov ];Weekley, Jim K [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov];H arper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov];nfi eld@berrydunn.com;Marnie Hudson [mudson@berrydunn.com]; Daniel Adam [DAdam@berrydunn.com];e mccoy@berrydunn.com;'Scot tTwigg' [stwigg@berrydunn.com];'Ke vin Bell' [kevin.bell@montroseconsulting.com];'MiJohnson @pcgus.com' [MiJohnson@pcgus.com];Ha wkins, Dawn [lucinda.hawkins@optum.co m];Richards, Shannon [shannon.richards@optum.co m];Furney, Lake [lake.furney@optum.com]; Davis, Justin J	RE: Client Account Pre-Design Discussion	RE_Client Account Pre- Design Discussion	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000549 277.0001.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A Jones, Staci R	N/A	client account action items 3 03 2020a.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI

								documents for this case.
CTRL0000549 277.0002	EML	3/17/2020 14:15	Lawrence, Tammy J [Tammy.J.Lawrence@wv.gov]	[Staci.R.Jones@wv.gov];Hop pe, Jacquelyn P [Jacquelyn.P.Hoppe@wv.gov];Weekley, Jim K [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov];Harper,Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov];nfield@berrydunn.com;Marnie Hudson [mhudson@berrydunn.com];Daniel Adam [DAdam@berrydunn.com];emccoy@berrydunn.com;'Scot tTwigg' [sttwigg@berrydunn.com];'Kevin Bell' [kevin.bell@montroseconsulting.com];'MiJohnson@pcgus.com' [MiJohnson@pcgus.com];Hawkins, Dawn [lucinda.hawkins@optum.co m];Richards, Shannon [shannon.richards@optum.co m];Furney, Lake [lake.furney@optum.com];Davis, Justin J	Client Account Pre-Design Discussion	Client Account Pre-Design Discussion	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000549 277.0002.0001	XLS	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Copy of OFS4990- 20200100.xls	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000549 591	MSG	4/30/2020 13:58	Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]	Nicole Becnel [nbecnel@berrydunn.com];	Contact Tracing Strategic Plan DRAFT	00000000DE975 9CA1CC590408 CC7E6DBADD8 7D9804582000. MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0000549 591.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Contact Tracing Strategic Plan DRAFT.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000549 603	MSG	4/30/2020 10:31	Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]	Samples, Jeremiah [Jeremiah.Samples@wv.gov]	Initial Contact Tracing Outline	00000000DE975 9CA1CC590408 CC7E6DBADD8 7D9884592000. MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000549 603.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200423_Contact_Tracing_Outline.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000550 164	MSG	4/29/2020 15:31	Julie Sullivan [jsullivan@berrydunn.com]	Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]; Atkins, Amy D [Amy.D.Atkins@wv.gov]; Charles, Shaun L [Shaun.L.Charles@wv.gov]; Sanders, Sarah K [Sarah.K.Sanders@wv.gov]; Farley, Shawn O [Shawn.O.Farley@wv.gov]; Cottrill, Logan R CPT USARMY NG WVARNG (USA) [logan.r.cottrill2.mil@mail.mil]; Mason, Lindsey J [Lindsey.J.Mason@wv.gov]; Lewis, Catherine B [Catherine.B.Lewis@wv.gov]; Erica R. Thomason [erica.r.thomason@wv.gov]; Nicole Becnel [nbecnel@berrydunn.com]; Danni Ricks [DRicks@berrydunn.com]; Kirsten Bickford [kbickford@berrydunn.com]	[External] Contact Tracing Technology Meeting Notes	00000000DE975 9CA1CC590408 CC7E6DBADD8 7D9804A02000. MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of meeting notes reflecting internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing program.
CTRL0000550 164.0001	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	Jones, Staci R	20200428_Contact_Tracing_Technology_Notes.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Meeting notes reflecting internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing program.

CTRL0000550887	MSG	3/6/2020 16:32	Lawrence, Tammy J [Tammy.J.Lawrence@wv.gov]	[Staci.R.Jones@wv.gov];Hop pe, Jacquelyn P [Jacquelyn.P.Hoppe@wv.gov];Weekley, Jim K [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov];Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov];nfield@berrydunn.com;Marnie Hudson [mhudson@berrydunn.com]; Daniel Adam [DAdam@berrydunn.com];emccoy@berrydunn.com;'Scott Twigg' [stwigg@berrydunn.com];Kevin Bell' [kevin.bell@montroseconsulting.com];MiJohnson@pcgus.com' [MiJohnson@pcgus.com];Hawkins, Dawn [lucinda.hawkins@optum.com];Richards, Shannon [shannon.richards@optum.com];Furney, Lake [lake.furney@optum.com]; Davis, Justin J	RE: Client Account Pre-Design Discussion	00000000DE9759CA1CC590408CC7E6DBADD87D9844FB2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000550887.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	client account action items 3 03 2020a.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000553991	MSG	10/25/2019 10:32	Hayes, Anita M [Anita.M.Hayes@wv.gov]	Rager, Matthew [matthew.rager@optum.com]; Minor, Leonard Alvis [leonard.minor@optum.com]; Alspaugh, Jeffery Alan [jeffrey.a.alspaugh@optum.com]; Jeannette McGee [jeannette.evans@optum.com]; nfield@berrydunn.com;Carte, Zachary D [zachary.carte@optum.com]; Cunningham, Brian A [brian.cunningham6@optum.com]; Young, Sarah K [Sarah.K.Young@wv.gov]; Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]; emccoy@berrydunn.com; Newhouse, Linda F [Linda.F.Newhouse@wv.gov]; Jamie Brennan [jbrennan@berrydunn.com]; Hoffman, Kim R [kim.r.hoffman@optum.com]; Hayes, Anita M [Anita.M.Hayes@wv.gov]	RE: Review Questions on Mandatory Fields for Medicaid and/or MPA applications	0000000047438CE2ADD7841BB62E669E76B7A1084122000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000553991.0001	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/ASKuza, Sally	N/A	Copy of UX1_Medicaid+MPA Applications_Mandatory Fields_v5.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000554089	MSG	10/28/2019 9:35	Rager, Matthew [matthew.rager@optum.com]	[sally.skuz@optum.com]; Baune, Scott A [scott.baune@optum.com]; Khosla, Rahul [rahul_khosla@optum.com]; Sergeant, Michelle [michelle.sergeant@optum.com]; Milton, Linda [linda.milton@optum.com]; Newhouse, Linda F [Linda.F.Newhouse@wv.gov]; Jamie Brennan [jbrennan@berrydunn.com]; Hoffman, Kim R [kim.r.hoffman@optum.com]; Ayvaz, Banipal [banipal.ayvaz@optum.com]; Mathew, Mercie [mercie_mathew@optum.com]; Carte, Zachary D [zachary.carte@optum.com]; Yadav, Satendra P [satendra_p_yadav@optum.com]; Alspaugh, Jeffery Alan [jeffrey.a.alspaugh@optum.com]; Minor, Leonard Alvis [leonard.minor@optum.com];	[External] Update Mandatory Fields for Medicaid and/or MPA applications	0000000047438CE2ADD7841BB62E669E76B7A10C41E2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000554 089.0001	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	Beane, Cynthia E (BMS)	N/A	UX1_Medicaid+ MPA Applications_Ma ndatory Fields_v6.xlsx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000554 607	MSG	9/23/2019 11:10	Jarrett, Beth [Beth.Jarrett @wv.gov]	[Cynthia.E.Beane@wv.gov]; Crouch, Bill J [Bill.J.Crouch@wv.gov];Sam ples, Jeremiah [Jeremiah.Samples@wv.gov] ;Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov];Ja cobs, Garrett M [Garrett.M.Jacobs@wv.gov]; Wiseman, Jeff A [Jeff.A.Wiseman@wv.gov];N owviskie, Kent R [Kent.R.Nowviskie@wv.gov] ;Buckner, Tara L [Tara.L.Buckner@wv.gov];C ain, Jon W [Jon.W.Cain@wv.gov];brian. cunningham6@optum.com;D avis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov];tegi lpin@hsc.wvu.edu;nbcnel@ berrydunn.com;nfield@berry dunn.com;DHHR Secretary CR100E ODS [DHHRSecretaryCR100E@ wv.gov];Bates, Rae J anita.m.hayes@wv.gov; [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov];Baile	IES Update	0000000047438C CE2ADD7841BB 62E669E76B7A1 0E45F2000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.	
CTRL0000559 504	MSG	11/22/2019 7:59	Rager, Matthew [matthew.rag er@optum.c om]	emccoy@berrydunn.com;Rak esh Kuttoppillil [rKuttoppillil@berrydunn.co m];Kurten, Mark [mark.kurten66@optum.com] ;Jeannette McGee [jeannette.evans@optum.com ];nfield@berrydunn.com;Cun ningham, Brian A [brian.cunningham6@optum. com];justin.j.davis@wv.gov; Newhouse, Linda F [Linda.F.Newhouse@wv.gov ];Ayvaz, Banipal [banipal.ayvaz@optum.com]; Mathew, Mercie [mercie_mathew@optum.co m];Carte, Zachary D [zachary.carte@optum.com]; Khosla, Rahul [rahul_khosla@optum.com]; Milton, Linda [linda.milton@optum.com];B aune, Scott A [scott.baune@optum.com];Sk uza, Sally [sally.skuz@optum.com];Se	RE: Update Mandatory Fields for Medicaid and/or MPA applications_v9	0000000067E87B 17B9846045A04 1063ED58B36C C840C2000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.	

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000559 504.0001	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	UX1_Medicaid+ MPA Applications_Ma ndatory Fields_v9.xlsx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000560 470	MSG	11/15/2019 16:44	Mo Maitland [mmaitland@berrydunn.com]	Jamie Brennan [jbrennan@berrydunn.com]; Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov];Dillon, Jason I [Jason.I.Dillon@wv.gov];Gilpin, Tom [tegilpin@hsc.wvu.edu];Duval, Robert [Robert.Duval@hsc.wvu.edu];Jones, Amanda [aajones@hsc.wvu.edu];Nicolle Field [nfield@berrydunn.com];Nor a Gilligan [NGilligan@berrydunn.com]; Ruth Ferris [rferris@berrydunn.com]; Crystal Gray [cgray@berrydunn.com]	[External] Notes Delivery: 20191113 Monthly WV IES IV&V Certification and Compliance Meeting	0000000067E87B 17B9846045A04 1063ED58B36C C24862000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000560 470.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20191113_Monthly WV IES IV&V Certification and Compliance Touchpoint Notes.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000560 605	MSG	11/14/2019 19:25	Rager, Matthew [matthew.rager@optum.com]	[jeffrey.a.alspaugh@optum.com];Jamie Brennan [jbrennan@berrydunn.com];emccoy@berrydunn.com;Rakesh Kuttappillil [rkuttappillil@berrydunn.com];Kurten, Mark [mark.kurten66@optum.com];Jeannette McGee [jeannette.evans@optum.com];anita.m.hayes@wv.gov;nfield@berrydunn.com;Cunningham, Brian A [brian.cunningham6@optum.com];justin.j.davis@wv.gov;Newhouse, Linda F [Linda.F.Newhouse@wv.gov];Hoffman, Kim R [kim.r.hoffman@optum.com];Ayvaz, Banipal [banipal.ayvaz@optum.com];Mathew, Mercie [mercie_mathew@optum.com];Carte, Zachary D [zachary.carte@optum.com];Khosla, Rahul [rahul_khosla@optum.com];	RE: Update Mandatory Fields for Medicaid and/or MPA applications v8	0000000067E87B 17B9846045A04 1063ED58B36C C04972000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.
Defendants' Privilege Log
1/10/2024

Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000560605.0001	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	UX1_Medicaid+MPA Applications_Mandatory Fields_v8.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000561311	MSG	10/24/2019 20:11	Rager, Matthew [matthew.rager@optum.com]	Minor, Leonard Alvis [leonard.minor@optum.com]; Alspaugh, Jeffery Alan [jeffrey.a.alspaugh@optum.com]; Jeannette McGee [jeannette.evans@optum.com]; anita.m.hayes@wv.gov; nfield@berrydunn.com; Carte, Zachary D [zachary.carte@optum.com]; Cunningham, Brian A [brian.cunningham6@optum.com]; Young, Sarah K [Sarah.K.Young@wv.gov]; Justin J. Davis [justin.j.davis@wv.gov]; emccoy@berrydunn.com; Newhouse, Linda F [Linda.F.Newhouse@wv.gov]; Jamie Brennan [jbrennan@berrydunn.com]; Hoffman, Kim R [kim.r.hoffman@optum.com]	RE: Review Questions on Mandatory Fields for Medicaid and/or MPA applications	0000000067E87B17B9846045A041063ED58B36C64F02000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of meeting notes reflecting internal, pre-decisional deliberation regarding development of Medicare application system.
CTRL0000561311.0001	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	UX1_Medicaid+MPA Applications_Mandatory Fields_v5.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Meeting notes reflecting internal, pre-decisional deliberation regarding development of Medicare application system.
CTRL0000561774	MSG	10/31/2019 15:34	Rager, Matthew [matthew.rager@optum.com]	[sally.skuz@optum.com]; Baune, Scott A [scott.baune@optum.com]; Khosla, Rahul [rahul_khosla@optum.com]; Sergeant, Michelle [michelle.sergeant@optum.com]; Milton, Linda [linda.milton@optum.com]; Newhouse, Linda F [Linda.F.Newhouse@wv.gov]; Jamie Brennan [jbrennan@berrydunn.com]; Hoffman, Kim R [kim.r.hoffman@optum.com]; Ayvaz, Banipal [banipal.ayvaz@optum.com]; Mathew, Mercie [mercie_mathew@optum.com]; Carte, Zachary D [zachary.carte@optum.com]; Yadav, Satendra P [satendra_p_yadav@optum.com]; Alspaugh, Jeffery Alan [jeffrey.a.alspaugh@optum.com]; Minor, Leonard Alvis [leonard.minor@optum.com]	RE: Update Mandatory Fields for Medicaid and/or MPA applications	0000000067E87B17B9846045A041063ED58B36CA42A2100.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.

Defendants' Privilege Log

1/10/2024



Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000561774.0001	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	UX1_Medicaid+MPA Applications_Mandatory Fields_v7.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000566531	MSG	2/4/2020 9:33	Bates, Rae J [Rae.J.Bates@wv.gov]	Charles, Shaun L [Shaun.L.Charles@wv.gov]; Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]; Jarrett, Beth [Beth.Jarrett@wv.gov]	Support...	000000008E1A77F4D1436245BF971DF82FC5C1BCE4A22000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000568675	MSG	6/14/2019 16:29	Jamie Brennan [jbrennan@berrydunn.com]	Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]; Nicole Field [nfield@berrydunn.com];	RE: Comments on Proposed AFCARS Changes	000000001F787215255F7A4A94C50731BC13FBB2A47C2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to submission of comments on proposed rule.
CTRL0000568675.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Proposed AFCARS Changes.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to submission of comments on proposed rule.
CTRL0000672302	MSG	6/9/2021 11:23	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]	Belcher, William E [William.E.Belcher@wv.gov];	RE: Progress on PIP	00000000C0805D884B15A94EA2BD9522143594CAC4732000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000672304	MSG	6/9/2021 10:20	Belcher, William E [William.E.Belcher@wv.gov]	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov];	RE: Progress on PIP	00000000C0805D884B15A94EA2BD9522143594CA04742000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000672305	MSG	6/9/2021 10:11	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]	Belcher, William E [William.E.Belcher@wv.gov];	RE: Progress on PIP	00000000C0805D884B15A94EA2BD9522143594CA24742000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.
Defendants' Privilege Log
1/10/2024

Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000681839	MSG	6/3/2021 15:42	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]	Belcher, William E [William.E.Belcher@wv.gov];	FW: Progress on PIP	000000006985FD F7E708F84289B D743114C3466C 247C2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000686941	MSG	3/25/2021 14:05	Jamie Brennan [jbrennan@berrydunn.com]	Dunfee, Scott [jeffrey.dunfee@optum.com]; Barker, Shaun [shaun.barker@optum.com]; Alex Tannenbaum [atannenbaum@berrydunn.com]; Cunningham, Brian A [brian.cunningham6@optum.com]; Shaun.L.Charles@wv.gov; Kurten, Mark [mark.kurten66@optum.com]; Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov; Nicolé Becnel [nbecnel@berrydunn.com]; Kat Lawrence (Consulting) [katheryne.lawrence@berrydunn.com]; Georgiou, Kostantinos A [kostantinos_georgiou@optum.com]; Bautch, Christie [christie.bautch@optum.com]; WV_IES_Meetings [wvies_meetings@optum.com]; Holstein, Rachel K [rachel.holstein@optum.com]	[External] RE: PATH Strategic Touchpoint (Brainstorming)	00000000F6D67 E03E1FF6F4DB BD47FD0B4FD D922C4762000. MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000690817	MSG	3/25/2021 9:10	Dunfee, Scott [jeffrey.dunfee@optum.com]	jbrennan@berrydunn.com; Barker, Shaun [shaun.barker@optum.com]; Alex Tannenbaum [atannenbaum@berrydunn.com]; Cunningham, Brian A [brian.cunningham6@optum.com]; Shaun.L.Charles@wv.gov; Kurten, Mark [mark.kurten66@optum.com]; Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov; Nicolé Becnel [nbecnel@berrydunn.com]; Kat Lawrence (Consulting) [katheryne.lawrence@berrydunn.com]; Georgiou, Kostantinos A [kostantinos_georgiou@optum.com]; Bautch, Christie [christie.bautch@optum.com]; WV_IES_Meetings [wvies_meetings@optum.com]; Holstein, Rachel K [rachel.holstein@optum.com]	[External] RE: PATH Strategic Touchpoint (Brainstorming)	00000000C10E1 9CAD161544CB D76AB3AEABC 9E75E4472000. MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al., v. Jim Justice, et al.

## Defendants' Privilege Log

1/10/2024

Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
----------------	----------------	----------------	------	----------------------------	---------	-----------	-----------	-------------

CTRL0000690819	MSG	3/25/2021 8:58	Jamie Brennan [jbrennan@berrydunn.com]	Barker, Shaun [shaun.barker@optum.com]; Alex Tannenbaum [atannenbaum@berrydunn.com]; Dunfee, Scott [jeffrey.dunfee@optum.com]; Cunningham, Brian A [brian.cunningham6@optum.com]; Shaun.L.Charles@wv.gov; Kurten, Mark [mark.kurten66@optum.com]; Justin J. Davis@wv.gov; Nicol e Becnel [nbecnel@berrydunn.com]; Kat Lawrence (Consulting) [katheryne.lawrence@berrydunn.com]; Georgiou, Kostantinos A [kostantinos_georgiou@optum.com]; Bautch, Christie [christie.bautch@optum.com]; WV IES Meetings [wvies_meetings@optum.com]; Holstein, Rachel K [rachel.holstein@optum.com]	[External] RE: PATH Strategic Touchpoint (Brainstorming)	00000000C10E19CAD161544CB D76AB3AEABC 9E7524482000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000690823	MSG	3/24/2021 22:10	Barker, Shaun [shaun.barker@optum.com]	jbrennan@berrydunn.com; Alex Tannenbaum [atannenbaum@berrydunn.com]; Dunfee, Scott [jeffrey.dunfee@optum.com]; Cunningham, Brian A [brian.cunningham6@optum.com]; Shaun.L.Charles@wv.gov; Kurten, Mark [mark.kurten66@optum.com]; Justin J. Davis@wv.gov; Nicol e Becnel [nbecnel@berrydunn.com]; Kat Lawrence (Consulting) [katheryne.lawrence@berrydunn.com]; Georgiou, Kostantinos A [kostantinos_georgiou@optum.com]; Bautch, Christie [christie.bautch@optum.com]; WV IES Meetings [wvies_meetings@optum.com]; Holstein, Rachel K [rachel.holstein@optum.com]	[External] RE: PATH Strategic Touchpoint (Brainstorming)	00000000C10E19CAD161544CB D76AB3AEABC 9E75C4482000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000700161	MSG	2/15/2021 11:25	Cunningham, Brian A [brian.cunningham6@optum.com]	Kat Lawrence (Consulting) [katheryne.lawrence@berrydunn.com];jbrennan@berrydunn.com;Alex Tannenbaum [atannenbaum@berrydunn.com];Dunfee, Scott [jeffrey.dunfee@optum.com];Kurten, Mark [mark.kurten66@optum.com];Shaun.L.Charles@wv.gov;justin.j.davis@wv.gov;Nicole Becnel [nbecnel@berrydunn.com];Barker, Shaun [shaun.barker@optum.com];WV_IES_Meetings [wvies_meetings@optum.com];Holstein, Rachel K [rachel.holstein@optum.com]	[External] RE: PATH Strategic Touchpoint (Brainstorming)	00000000C9A403BCC9745C4DB793744439873637E4CC2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to prioritized development of PATH.
CTRL0000700171	MSG	2/15/2021 15:59	Nicole Becnel [nbecnel@berrydunn.com]	Cunningham, Brian A [brian.cunningham6@optum.com];Kat Lawrence (Consulting) [katheryne.lawrence@berrydunn.com];Jamie Brennan [jbrennan@berrydunn.com];Alex Tannenbaum [atannenbaum@berrydunn.com];Dunfee, Scott [jeffrey.dunfee@optum.com];Kurten, Mark [mark.kurten66@optum.com];Shaun.L.Charles@wv.gov;justin.j.davis@wv.gov;Barker, Shaun [shaun.barker@optum.com];WV_IES_Meetings [wvies_meetings@optum.com];Holstein, Rachel K [rachel.holstein@optum.com]	[External] RE: PATH Strategic Touchpoint (Brainstorming)	00000000C9A403BCC9745C4DB79374443987363724CE2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to prioritized development of PATH.
CTRL0000700826	MSG	2/10/2021 13:44	Cunningham, Brian A [brian.cunningham6@optum.com]	jbrennan@berrydunn.com;Alex Tannenbaum [atannenbaum@berrydunn.com];Dunfee, Scott [jeffrey.dunfee@optum.com];Kurten, Mark [mark.kurten66@optum.com];Shaun.L.Charles@wv.gov;justin.j.davis@wv.gov;Nicole Becnel [nbecnel@berrydunn.com];Kat Lawrence (Consulting) [katheryne.lawrence@berrydunn.com];Barker, Shaun [shaun.barker@optum.com];WV_IES_Meetings [wvies_meetings@optum.com];Holstein, Rachel K [rachel.holstein@optum.com]	[External] RE: PATH Strategic Touchpoint (Brainstorming)	00000000C9A403BCC9745C4DB793744439873637A4222100.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000700 826.0001	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Phase 2 Schedule and Topics.xlsx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000700 826.0002	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Session Participants - provider home study screens Ch 49 HB 2010.xlsx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000701 121	MSG	1/4/2021 17:02	DeBarr, Timothy R [Timothy.R. DeBarr@wv. gov]	Esser, Stein [stesser@deloitte.com]; Zalaznik, Keith [kzalaznik@deloitte.com];Ko utsonanos, Dimitrios [dkoutsonanos@deloitte.com ];Pierce Richards, Susan (CDC/DDPHSIS/CPR/DEO) [qra1@cdc.gov];Neely, Andrew M [Andrew.M.Neely@wv.gov]; Charles, Shaun L [Shaun.L.Charles@wv.gov]; Atkins, Amy D [Amy.D.Atkins@wv.gov];Co hn, Caitlin R [Caitlin.R.Cohn@wv.gov]	RE: [External] West Virginia HL7 Specs	0000000008E224 E9D167FB4FA31 EF934B40720F2 E4012000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000701 121.0001	TXT	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Data Elements.txt	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000702214	MSG	12/22/2020 12:10	Payton Waybright [pwaybright@berrydunn.com]	[atannenbaum@berrydunn.com]; WV_IES_Meetings [wvies_meetings@optum.com]; Charles, Shaun L [Shaun.L.Charles@wv.gov]; Dunfee, Scott [jeffrey.dunfee@optum.com]; Kurten, Mark [mark.kurten66@optum.com]; Davis, Justin J [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov]; Cunningham, Brian A [brian.cunningham6@optum.com]; Kat Lawrence (Consulting) [katheryne.lawrence@berrydunn.com]; shaun.barker@optum.com; Jamie Brennan [jbrennan@berrydunn.com]; Noeman Ahmed [nahmed@berrydunn.com]; Eric Zimmerman [eZimmerman@berrydunn.com]; Georgiou, Kostantinos A [kostantinos_georgiou@optum.com]; Streets, Emily C [emily.streets@optum.com];	[External] Re: Path Forward on CW Design Validation	0000000008E224E9D167FB4FA31EF934B40720F2448C2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000702214.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20201218_PATH_Path_Forward_CW_Design_Validation_Meeting_Notes.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000702233	MSG	12/4/2020 9:53	King, Lisa A [Lisa.A.King@wv.gov]	Piske, Matthew B WO1 USARMY NG WVARNG (USA) [matthew.b.piske.mil@mail.mil]; Hatfield, Walter J LTC USARMY NG WVARNG (USA) [walter.j.hatfield.mil@mail.mil]; Goforth, Joshua J CPT USARMY NG WVARNG (USA) [joshua.j.goforth2.mil@mail.mil]; Lisa costello [costello.lisa@gmail.com]; Charles, Shaun L [Shaun.L.Charles@wv.gov]; Nowviskie, Kent R [Kent.R.Nowviskie@wv.gov]; Blume, James W III WO1 USARMY NG WVARNG (USA) [james.w.blume.mil@mail.mil]	RE: [External] RE: Heat map	0000000008E224E9D167FB4FA31EF934B40720F2C48E2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000702 233.0001	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Available Layers.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000719 257	MSG	10/27/2020 15:22	Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]; Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]	RE: case closure SOP	000000006E071B 04878F584B80B A86ADBA1EF48 764A62000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000719 383	MSG	10/20/2020 13:41	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov];	RE: case closure SOP	000000006E071B 04878F584B80B A86ADBA1EF48 7E4C12000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of case closure policy.
CTRL0000719 383.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP Case Closure Draft 1019-2020 with revisions and comments TO comment.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of case closure policy.
CTRL0000719 646	MSG	10/27/2020 14:56	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]	Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]; Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]; Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]	FW: case closure SOP	000000006E071B 04878F584B80B A86ADBA1EF48 784FA2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000719 646.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP Case Closure Draft 1027-2020 with revisions and comments.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000720 592	MSG	10/8/2020 9:20	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov];	RE: case closure SOP	000000008A88D 35C54466A4185 797226DD6B8E EAA4532000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000720592.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP Case Closure Draft 107-2020 with revisions and comments.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000720594	MSG	10/7/2020 17:45	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]; Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov];	RE: case closure SOP	000000008A88D35C54466A4185797226DD6B8EEA04542000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000720594.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP Case Closure Draft 107-2020 with revisions and comments.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000720844	MSG	10/26/2020 9:05	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov];	RE: case closure SOP	000000008A88D35C54466A4185797226DD6B8EEA847E2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of case closure policy.
CTRL0000720844.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP Case Closure Draft 1025-2020 with revisions and comments.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of case closure policy.
CTRL0000720846	MSG	10/26/2020 10:21	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov];	FW: case closure SOP	000000008A88D35C54466A4185797226DD6B8EEAC47E2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of case closure policy.
CTRL0000720846.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP Case Closure Draft 1025-2020 with revisions and comments.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of case closure policy.



CTRL0000720 893	MSG	10/21/2020 7:49	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L. Urquhart@wv.gov]	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov];	RE: case closure SOP	000000008A88D 35C54466A4185 797226DD6B8E EAA48B2000.M SG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of case closure policy.
--------------------	-----	-----------------	---	--	----------------------	--	--------------------------------------	--

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000720 893.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP Case Closure Draft 1019-2020 with revisions and comments.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of case closure policy.
CTRL0000721 203	MSG	10/19/2020 14:28	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov];	RE: case closure SOP	000000008A88D 35C54466A4185 797226DD6B8E EAE4CB2000.M SG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of case closure policy.
CTRL0000721 203.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP Case Closure Draft 1019-2020 with revisions and comments.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of case closure policy.
CTRL0000721 272	MSG	9/29/2020 16:22	Hymes, Amy L [Amy.L.Hymes@wv.gov]	Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]; CSEDW and Therapeutic Foster Care Follow-Up [Janie.M.Cole@wv.gov];	FW: [External] CSEDW and Therapeutic Foster Care Follow-Up	000000008A88D 35C54466A4185 797226DD6B8E EAA4DC2000.M SG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000721 335	MSG	10/16/2020 11:44	Woodman Kaehler, Pamela M [Pamela.M.WoodmanKaehler@wv.gov]	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]; Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov];	Communication Considerations	000000008A88D 35C54466A4185 797226DD6B8E EAC4E92000.M SG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000721 335.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Communication Considerations.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0000723550	MSG	5/19/2021 16:29	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]	Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov];	RE: follow up on Jeremiah's request.	000000001D222AF7E7082C4680756C0D8D6D8CAB04422100.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
----------------	-----	-----------------	--	---	--------------------------------------	--	--------------------------------	---

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000723550.0001	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	CSM Performance Standards & Expectations.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000723550.0002	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Safety Culture Survey Scales and Guidelines_10.7.2020_final.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000735968	MSG	3/1/2022 10:47	Heldreth, Beverly S [beverly.s.heldreth@wv.gov]	Richards, Susan M [susan.m.richards@wv.gov]; Sloan, Angie D [angie.d.sloan@wv.gov]; Tucker, Marilou A [marilou.a.tucker@wv.gov]; Beckett, Jennifer M [jennifer.m.beckett@wv.gov]; Bragg, Lorie L [lorie.l.bragg@wv.gov]; Rossana, Mary T [mary.t.rossana@wv.gov]; Butler, Paul E [meaghan.e.goffreda@wv.gov]; paul.e.butler@wv.gov]	Re: Revised Statewide Manager and Supervisor Meetings, Regional Worker Meetings	0000000026412F6D52E7514EA128FB1D8BE1C7D1C46E2100.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual

								review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000735 968.0001	EML	2/25/2022 10:46	Tucker, Marilou A [Marilou.A.Tucker@wv.gov]	;Connie S Roush [connie.s.roush@wv.gov];Chad A Blankenship [chad.a.blankenship@wv.gov];Sarah I VanAtta [sarah.i.bleigh@wv.gov];Theresa R Blevins [theresa.r.blevins@wv.gov];Barbara L Boothe [barbara.l.booth@wv.gov];Mary S Boren [mary.s.boren@wv.gov];Roann W Bosley [roann.w.bosley@wv.gov];Carla E Bragg [carla.e.bragg@wv.gov];Jessica L Campbell [jessica.l.campbell@wv.gov];Heather N Deeds [heather.n.deeds@wv.gov];Cory S Delbaugh [cory.s.delbaugh@wv.gov];Chelsey L Eller [chelsey.l.eller@wv.gov];Vanity B Gastin [vanity.b.gastin@wv.gov];Jennifer L Hall [jennifer.l.hall@wv.gov];Stephani	*Meeting Announcement* Child Welfare Statewide Supervisor/Manager Meeting	_Meeting Announcement_ Child Welfare Statewide Supervisor_Man ger Meeting.cml	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al., v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000735 968.0001.0001	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	How Do I Register for a WV DHHR Course in GoSignMeUp.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0000735 968.0002	EML	2/17/2022 16:28	Tucker, Marilou A [Marilou.A.T ucker@wv.g ov]	Bragg, Lorie L [lorie.l.bragg@wv.gov]; Beverly S Heldreth [beverly.s.heldreth@wv.gov]; Jennifer M Beckett [jennifer.m.beckett@wv.gov] ;Angie D Sloan [angie.d.sloan@wv.gov];Susan M Richards [susan.m.richards@wv.gov]; Butler, Paul E [paul.e.butler@wv.gov];Muc k, Leigh A [WV PATH SPMO Meetings leigh.a.muck@wv.gov]	Re: Statewide Manager, Supervisor, Worker Meeting Dates	Re_ Statewide Manager, Supervisor, Worker Meeting Dates.eml	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000736 290	MSG	3/8/2022 15:49	Morgan Krieger [Morgan.Kri eger@berryd unn.com]	[WVPATHSPMOMeetings@ berrydunn.com];Nora Gilligan [NGilligan@berrydunn.com]; Alex Tannenbaum [atannenbaum@berrydunn.co m];Crystal Gray [cgray@berrydunn.com];justi n.j.davis [justin.j.davis@wv.gov];Dea n, Traci A [Traci.A.Dean@wv.gov];Carl a Harper [carla.j.harper@wv.gov];Dea n, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov]; Streets, Emily C [emily.streets@optum.com];S paulding, Brandy J [brandy.spaulding@optum.co m];Johnson, Michael [michael.johnson18@optum.c om];miquel.a.stubbs@cgi.co m';miquel.stubbs@optum.co m';[miquel.stubbs@optum.com]; jana.patchen@cgi.com';susan	RE: WV PATH Dry Run: CCWIS Intake Demonstration for Federal Partners - Informational	0000000026412F 6D52E7514EA12 8FB1D8BE1C7D 1849E2100.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000736 290.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20220304_WV_P ATH_Dry_Run_ CCWIS_Intake_ Demo_Federal_P artners_Meeting_ Notes.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000736 632	MSG	2/17/2023 7:52	Richards, Susan M [susan.m.rich ards@wv.gov]	VanNoy, Regina [regina.vannoy@wv.gov];	Fwd: Application for Health and Human Resources Specialist, SeniorJob Posting: BSS2300027	00000000876871 08C7002A4985E CA82D73B34835 24022000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0000736 632.0001	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Bhebe Ishmael Application HHR Specialist, Senior Job Posting BSS2300027.pdf	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000736 632.0002	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Ishmael M Bhebe Resume - Feb 2022.pdf	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000736 632.0003	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Bhebe FPU Doctorate Transcri pt - 2 pages plus Key for gradesmin.pdf	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000736 632.0004	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Master of Arts in Teaching Transcript_.pdf	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000736 632.0005	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	University of Zimbabwe Ph D Degree and Transcript 2005 to 2009.pdf	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0000736 632.0006	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Bhebhe- Sample Writing Published Article.pdf	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000736 632.0007	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Bhebhe M Book Jacket 3rd Book Publication.pdf	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000736 633	MSG	2/16/2023 22:29	Bhebhe, Ishmael M [ishmael.m.b hebhe@wv.g ov]	Susan M Richards [Susan.M.Richards@wv.gov] ;	Application for Health and Human Resources Specialist, SeniorJob Posting: BSS2300027	00000000876871 08C7002A4985E CA82D73B34835 44022000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000736 633.0001	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Bhebhe Ishmael Application HHR Specialist, Senior Job Posting BSS2300027.pdf	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000736 633.0002	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Ishmael M Bhebhe Resume - Feb 2022.pdf	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0000736 633.0003	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Bhebe FPU Doctorate Transcript - 2 pages plus Key for gradesmin.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000736 633.0004	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Master of Arts in Teaching Transcript .pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000736 633.0005	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	University of Zimbabwe Ph D Degree and Transcript 2005 to 2009.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000736 633.0006	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Bhebe- Sample Writing Published Article.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000736 633.0007	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Bhebe M Book Jacket 3rd Book Publication.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0000806917	MSG	1/5/2022 15:06	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]; Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]	Re: social messaging for contact tracing	0000000050830C8CE8F4CD4784CF2A597C80C9FC64402000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000806929	MSG	1/5/2022 14:40	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]; Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]	Re: social messaging for contact tracing	0000000050830C8CE8F4CD4784CF2A597C80C9FCE4412000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000806931	MSG	1/5/2022 14:38	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]; Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]	Re: social messaging for contact tracing	0000000050830C8CE8F4CD4784CF2A597C80C9FC24422000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000806933	MSG	1/5/2022 14:37	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]; Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]	Re: social messaging for contact tracing	0000000050830C8CE8F4CD4784CF2A597C80C9FC64422000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000806934	MSG	1/5/2022 14:34	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]; Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]	Re: social messaging for contact tracing	0000000050830C8CE8F4CD4784CF2A597C80C9FC84422000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description



CTRL0000806 935	MSG	1/5/2022 14:30	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]; Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	Re: social messaging for contact tracing	0000000050830C 8CE8F4CD4784 CF2A597C80C9 FCA4422000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000806 941	MSG	1/5/2022 14:14	Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]; Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	Re: social messaging for contact tracing	0000000050830C 8CE8F4CD4784 CF2A597C80C9 FC64432000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000806 954	MSG	1/5/2022 13:45	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]; Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]	Re: social messaging for contact tracing	0000000050830C 8CE8F4CD4784 CF2A597C80C9 FC04452000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000806 956	MSG	1/5/2022 13:40	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]; Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]	Re: social messaging for contact tracing	0000000050830C 8CE8F4CD4784 CF2A597C80C9 FC44452000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000806 957	MSG	1/5/2022 13:36	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]; Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Re: social messaging for contact tracing	0000000050830C 8CE8F4CD4784 CF2A597C80C9 FC64452000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000806 959	MSG	1/5/2022 13:35	Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]; Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Re: social messaging for contact tracing	0000000050830C 8CE8F4CD4784 CF2A597C80C9 FCA4452000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								

Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000806971	MSG	1/5/2022 13:22	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]; Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov];	Fwd: social messaging for contact tracing	0000000050830C8CE8F4CD4784CF2A597C80C9FC24472000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of contact tracing social media messages.
CTRL0000807885	MSG	1/5/2022 14:54	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]; Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]	Re: social messaging for contact tracing	0000000050830C8CE8F4CD4784CF2A597C80C9FC44BC2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000807885.0001	JPG	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	sick child with dad.jpg	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000807885.0002	JPG	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	young-woman-2239269_960_720.jpg	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000807885.0003	JPG	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	woman-698971_960_720.jpg	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000807885.0004	JPG	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	comfort daughter small.jpg	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000819583	MSG	2/27/2020 14:19	Adler, Allison C [Allison.C.Adler@wv.gov]	Damron, Jordan L [Jordan.L.Damron@wv.gov]; Takitch, Nathan M [Nathan.M.Takitch@wv.gov]; Crouch, Bill J [Bill.J.Crouch@wv.gov]; Holstein, Jessica N [Jessica.N.Holstein@wv.gov]	draft	0000000010BC79CF8ABFFF45BE0FEB3B031ED164C4A22000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000819583.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	DRAFT DHHR Confirms Possible COVID-19 Case.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000820607	MSG	8/20/2020 13:54	Adler, Allison C [Allison.C.Adler@wv.gov]	Crouch, Bill J [Bill.J.Crouch@wv.gov]; Amjad, Ayne [Ayne.Amjad@wv.gov];	FW: [External] Medical Officer Recommendations	000000008B02D2403E3BAB4CB7FB276655144A9304202000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000820607.0001	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Mercer County Department of Health - 8_19_2020 Recommendations (1).pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000820607.0002	JPG	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Mask.jpg	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000890077	MSG	3/6/2023 15:59	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	DHHR Communications [dhhrcommunications@wv.gov];	minor edits	000000005D8DD91C90A8C442B823D7F077D74337A4B22000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000890077.0001	DOC	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Letter of Denial to Providers Regarding Lack of Supporting Documentation_edits.doc	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000890077.0002	DOC	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Letter of Denial to Unverified Providers_edits.doc	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000911361	MSG	9/15/2021 12:09	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]; Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Re: draft social media posts: Case Investigators	00000000DE785C59B227AF41AB57F791B2617EA044242000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000911391	MSG	9/15/2021 12:04	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]; Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	Re: draft social media posts: Case Investigators	00000000DE785C59B227AF41AB57F791B2617EA024282000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000911392	MSG	9/15/2021 12:06	Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]; Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	Re: draft social media posts: Case Investigators	00000000DE785C59B227AF41AB57F791B2617EA044282000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000911401	MSG	9/14/2021 15:40	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]; Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]	Re: Draft - Contact Tracing	00000000DE785C59B227AF41AB57F791B2617EA064292000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000911405	MSG	9/14/2021 15:42	Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]; Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	Re: Draft - Contact Tracing	00000000DE785C59B227AF41AB57F791B2617EA0E4292000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000911406	MSG	9/14/2021 15:42	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]; Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	Re: Draft - Contact Tracing	00000000DE785C59B227AF41AB57F791B2617EA0042A2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000911412	MSG	9/14/2021 15:51	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]; Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	Re: Draft - Contact Tracing	00000000DE785C59B227AF41AB57F791B2617EA0C42A2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000911415	MSG	9/14/2021 15:55	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]; Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]	Re: Draft - Contact Tracing	00000000DE785C59B227AF41AB57F791B2617EA0242B2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000911439	MSG	9/15/2021 15:02	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]; Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Re: draft social media posts: Case Investigators	00000000DE785C59B227AF41AB57F791B2617EA0442E2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000911470	MSG	9/15/2021 12:15	Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]; Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Re: draft social media posts: Case Investigators	00000000DE785C59B227AF41AB57F791B2617EA064322000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000911473	MSG	9/15/2021 12:17	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]; Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Re: draft social media posts: Case Investigators	00000000DE785C59B227AF41AB57F791B2617EA0C4322000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000911927	MSG	9/16/2021 15:03	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]; Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]	Re: draft social media posts: Case Investigators	00000000DE785C59B227AF41AB57F791B2617EA0E4722000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000912347	MSG	9/9/2021 8:50	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	DHHRCommunications@wv.gov;	Re: contact tracing posts	00000000DE785C59B227AF41AB57F791B2617EA084AD2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000912918	MSG	9/3/2021 16:09	DHHRCommunications@wv.gov	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]; DHHRCommunications@wv.gov;Holstein, Jessica N [jessica.n.holstein@wv.gov]	Re: skills	00000000DE785C59B227AF41AB57F791B2617EA084F82000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of COVID social messaging.
CTRL0000912919	MSG	9/3/2021 16:03	Holstein, Jessica N [jessica.n.holstein@wv.gov]	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]; DHHRCommunications@wv.gov	Re: skills	00000000DE785C59B227AF41AB57F791B2617EA0A4F82000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								

Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000912920	MSG	9/3/2021 16:01	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	DHHRCommunications@wv.gov; Holstein, Jessica N [jessica.n.holstein@wv.gov]	Re: skills	00000000DE785C59B227AF41AB57F791B2617EA0C4F82000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000912929	MSG	9/3/2021 15:22	DHHRCommunications@wv.gov	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]; DHHRCommunications@wv.gov; Holstein, Jessica N [jessica.n.holstein@wv.gov]	Re: skills	00000000DE785C59B227AF41AB57F791B2617EA0E4F92000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000912939	MSG	9/3/2021 14:44	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	DHHRCommunications@wv.gov; Holstein, Jessica N [jessica.n.holstein@wv.gov]	Re: skills	00000000DE785C59B227AF41AB57F791B2617EA024FB2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000918998	MSG	9/2/2021 16:40	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	McBee, Shannon M [shannon.m.mcbree@wv.gov]; Amjad, Ayne [ayne.amjad@wv.gov]; DHHR Communications [dhhrrcommunications@wv.gov]	Re: skills	00000000415EAD0C8F245C49906990E4A0E1167A4302000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000918998.0001	PNG	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Notifying Close Contacts infographic (1).png	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000920011	MSG	8/26/2021 15:14	Adler, Allison C [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]; Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]; Holstein, Jessica N [jessica.n.holstein@wv.gov]	Re: CDC resource	00000000415EAD0C8F245C49906990E4A0E116704BA2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of COVID social messaging.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000920016	MSG	8/26/2021 15:03	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]	Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]; Allison C Adler [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Re: CDC resource	00000000415EA D0C8F245C4990 06990E4A0E116 7A4BA2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000920018	MSG	8/26/2021 15:00	Hopta, Emily S [emily.s.hopta@wv.gov]	Lannom, Andrea M [andrea.m.lannom@wv.gov]; Allison C Adler [allison.c.adler@wv.gov]	Re: CDC resource	00000000415EA D0C8F245C4990 06990E4A0E116 7E4BA2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000936180	MSG	11/13/2019 9:39	McCallister, Jane B [Jane.B.McCallister@wv.gov]	Allman, Bethany R [Bethany.R.Allman@wv.gov]; Caplinger, Thelma K [Thelma.K.Caplinger@wv.gov]; Filipiak, Robin A [Robin.A.Filipiak@wv.gov]; Grafton, Betina K [Betina.K.Grafton@wv.gov]; Hamilton, Jeanie E [Jeanie.E.Hamilton@wv.gov]; Larew, Rhonda G [Rhonda.G.Larew@wv.gov]; McDonald, Lisa D [Lisa.D.McDonald@wv.gov]; Moore, Rosa S [Rosa.S.Moore@wv.gov]; Sheehan, Maryanne [Maryanne.Sheehan@wv.gov]; Whitlatch, Jamie L [Jamie.L.Whitlatch@wv.gov]; Wiedebusch, Robert E [Robert.E.Wiedebusch@wv.gov];	FW: QRTP Memo	000000008108F1 5F1CB84E45902 11EFBCF91A113 84072000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000936180.0001	DOC	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	QRTP Supplemental Memo 11-5-19.doc	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000936180.0002	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	FFPSA-QRTP Locations Map-10-24-19.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.

Defendants' Privilege Log



1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000936180.0003	VCF	N/A	N/A	N/A	Kevin M. Henson	Kevin M_Henson.vcf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000937800	MSG	1/28/2020 19:32	Urquhart, Melanie L. [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]	McCallister, Jane B [Jane.B.McCallister@wv.gov];	Re: FFA Tracks	0000000074EF3319B2A1AA4FB3FEB7389CCD630504362000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to training on use of FFA tracks.
CTRL0000956151	MSG	11/13/2019 9:39	McCallister, Jane B [Jane.B.McCallister@wv.gov]	Allman, Bethany R [Bethany.R.Allman@wv.gov]; Caplinger, Thelma K [Thelma.K.Caplinger@wv.gov]; Filipiak, Robin A [Robin.A.Filipiak@wv.gov]; Grafton, Betina K [Betina.K.Grafton@wv.gov]; Hamilton, Jeanie E [Jeanie.E.Hamilton@wv.gov]; Larew, Rhonda G [Rhonda.G.Larew@wv.gov]; McDonald, Lisa D [Lisa.D.McDonald@wv.gov]; Moore, Rosa S [Rosa.S.Moore@wv.gov]; Sheehan, Maryanne [Maryanne.Sheehan@wv.gov]; Whitlatch, Jamie L [Jamie.L.Whitlatch@wv.gov]; Wiedebusch, Robert E [Robert.E.Wiedebusch@wv.gov];	FW: QRTP Memo	00000000328D1B682318C14FBB70953F9D568F3AA40D2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000956151.0001	DOC	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	QRTP Supplemental Memo 11-5-19.doc	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000956151.0002	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	FFPSA-QRTP Locations Map-10-24-19.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.

Defendants' Privilege Log

1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000956151.0003	VCF	N/A	N/A	N/A	Kevin M. Henson	Kevin M_Henson.vcf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000971425	MSG	6/3/2021 15:09	McCallister, Jane B [Jane.B.McCallister@wv.gov]	Larew, Rhonda G [Rhonda.G.Larew@wv.gov];	RE: data from PIP progress	0000000053122AAEEA11F74C972565897ADCB562A4622000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000981654	MSG	6/3/2021 15:14	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]	Larew, Rhonda G [Rhonda.G.Larew@wv.gov]; McCallister, Jane B [Jane.B.McCallister@wv.gov];	RE: data from PIP progress	00000000DD43B587E3059241A2B6DEBDDC90443FA4142000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to methods for obtaining data.
CTRL0000981884	MSG	6/9/2021 11:32	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]	Larew, Rhonda G [Rhonda.G.Larew@wv.gov]; McCallister, Jane B [Jane.B.McCallister@wv.gov]	RE: Progress on PIP	00000000DD43B587E3059241A2B6DEBDDC90443FE44E2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000981885	MSG	6/9/2021 11:27	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]	Larew, Rhonda G [Rhonda.G.Larew@wv.gov]; McCallister, Jane B [Jane.B.McCallister@wv.gov]	RE: Progress on PIP	00000000DD43B587E3059241A2B6DEBDDC90443F044F2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000981886	MSG	6/8/2021 16:41	Larew, Rhonda G [Rhonda.G.Larew@wv.gov]	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; McCallister, Jane B [Jane.B.McCallister@wv.gov]	RE: Progress on PIP	00000000DD43B587E3059241A2B6DEBDDC90443F244F2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.
Defendants' Privilege Log
1/10/2024

Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000981888	MSG	6/3/2021 15:24	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]	McCallister, Jane B [Jane.B.McCallister@wv.gov]; Larew, Rhonda G [Rhonda.G.Larew@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]	RE: Progress on PIP	00000000DD43B587E3059241A2B6DEBDDC90443F04502000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000981889	MSG	6/3/2021 15:19	McCallister, Jane B [Jane.B.McCallister@wv.gov]	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; Larew, Rhonda G [Rhonda.G.Larew@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]	RE: Progress on PIP	00000000DD43B587E3059241A2B6DEBDDC90443F24502000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000981890	MSG	6/3/2021 15:16	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]	Larew, Rhonda G [Rhonda.G.Larew@wv.gov]; McCallister, Jane B [Jane.B.McCallister@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]	Progress on PIP	00000000DD43B587E3059241A2B6DEBDDC90443F44502000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000981891	MSG	6/3/2021 15:06	Larew, Rhonda G [Rhonda.G.Larew@wv.gov]	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; McCallister, Jane B [Jane.B.McCallister@wv.gov]	RE: data from PIP progress	00000000DD43B587E3059241A2B6DEBDDC90443F64502000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000981891.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Comparisons CFSR Items 14 and 15 calendar year 2019 and 2020.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000981891.0001.0001	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Microsoft Excel Worksheet.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.

Defendants' Privilege Log

1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000981891.0001.0002	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Microsoft_Excel Worksheet1.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000981891.0001.0003	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Microsoft_Excel Worksheet2.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000981891.0001.0004	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Microsoft_Excel Worksheet3.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000995191	MSG	1/17/2020 14:38	Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov]	Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]; Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]; Cole, Janie M [Janie.M.Cole@wv.gov]; Weekley, Jim K [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov]; Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov]	RE: QRTP Programs	00000000ABB76B0B74A7CB409FE0EF121BA88DB704192100.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to changes in QRTP program.
CTRL0000995195	MSG	1/10/2020 14:25	Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov]	Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]; Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]; Cole, Janie M [Janie.M.Cole@wv.gov]; Weekley, Jim K [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov]; Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov]; Bailey, Beatrice P [Beatrice.P.Bailey@wv.gov]	RE: QRTP Programs	00000000ABB76B0B74A7CB409FE0EF121BA88DB7041A2100.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.
Defendants' Privilege Log
1/10/2024

Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s) Urquhart, Melanie L	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0000999616	MSG	8/29/2019 20:39	Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]	[Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]; Lemasters, Cree H [Cree.H.Lemasters@wv.gov]; Whaley, Lance C [Lance.C.Whaley@wv.gov]; Grogg, Heather M [Heather.M.Grogg@wv.gov]; Belcher, William E [William.E.Belcher@wv.gov]; Beckett, Jennifer M [Jennifer.M.Beckett@wv.gov]; Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; Heldreth, Beverly S [Beverly.S.Heldreth@wv.gov]; Sloan, Angie D [Angie.D.Sloan@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]; Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov]; Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov]; Bertelli Coleman, Christina M	Re: [External] FW: [External] Severe Weather Preparation	00000000F3A5EE470B69514BBA685D230DC70291C4562000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000999616.0001	PNG	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	image001.png	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000999616.0002	JPG	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	image002.jpg	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000999616.0003	JPG	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	image003.jpg	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0000999 616.0004	JPG	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	image004.jpg	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0000999 616.0005	JPG	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	image005.jpg	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001001 210	MSG	4/2/2020 13:27	Urquhart, Melanie L. [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]	RE: Certification of Foster Homes	00000000C1AED 34E1D72634382 6164CDDEC497 0F24BE2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001001 211	MSG	4/2/2020 11:23	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]; Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]	RE: Certification of Foster Homes	00000000C1AED 34E1D72634382 6164CDDEC497 0F64BE2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to certifying foster homes.
CTRL0001001 212	MSG	4/1/2020 15:28	Urquhart, Melanie L. [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov];	Certification of Foster Homes	00000000C1AED 34E1D72634382 6164CDDEC497 0FC4BE2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001009 392	MSG	12/14/2020 9:45	Croft, Matthew J. [Matthew.J.Croft@wv.gov]	Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov];	Package	000000009EA83 A9471926045A6 9F739AD77BFF D3A4632100.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0001015 073	MSG	2/21/2020 17:12	Urquhart, Melanie L. [Melanie.L. Urquhart@wv.gov]	Holt, Pamela M [Pamela.M.Holt@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]	Reorg for Adoption and HF	00000000D4162 253AEFBA4BB8 B39E2814807F2 6E4532000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001015 073.0001	DOC	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Reorg Memo.doc	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001015 073.0002	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Director of SS New Organizational Chart - Combined.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001015 073.0003	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Adoption and HF Program Manager 2.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001015 073.0004	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	HF Program Manager 1.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001019 697	MSG	9/19/2019 16:33	Urquhart, Melanie L. [Melanie.L. Urquhart@wv.gov]	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov];	FFA Tracks	00000000DD728 FFF2A43FC4C8 B7F13B39BB35F 5744882000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to use of FFA Tracks.
CTRL0001019 697.0001	DOC	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	FFA Tracks - Staff Utilization Memo.doc	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to use of FFA Tracks.

Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001021753	MSG	6/14/2021 15:16	Weekley, Jim K [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov]	Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov]; Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]; Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov]; Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov]; Shavers, Gregory A [Gregory.A.Shavers@wv.gov]; Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]	RE: juvenile comp placements	000000002431A4 7AC42DDE4BA 8CC5DF075C07 177A40A2000.M SG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001021754	MSG	6/14/2021 15:06	Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov]	Weekley, Jim K [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov]; Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]; Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov]; Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov]; Shavers, Gregory A [Gregory.A.Shavers@wv.gov]; Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]	RE: juvenile comp placements	000000002431A4 7AC42DDE4BA 8CC5DF075C07 177C40A2000.M SG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001021755	MSG	6/14/2021 15:01	Weekley, Jim K [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov]	Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov]; Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]; Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov]; Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov]; Shavers, Gregory A [Gregory.A.Shavers@wv.gov]; Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]	RE: juvenile comp placements	000000002431A4 7AC42DDE4BA 8CC5DF075C07 177E40A2000.M SG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001021756	MSG	6/14/2021 10:24	Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov]	Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]; Shavers, Gregory A [Gregory.A.Shavers@wv.gov]; Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]; Weekley, Jim K [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov]; Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov]; Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov]	RE: juvenile comp placements	000000002431A4 7AC42DDE4BA 8CC5DF075C07 177440B2000.M SG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to obtaining additional placement options.
CTRL0001021758	MSG	6/11/2021 11:56	Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]	Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov];	RE: juvenile comp placements	000000002431A4 7AC42DDE4BA 8CC5DF075C07 177640C2000.M SG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.



Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001021759	MSG	6/11/2021 11:48	Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov]	Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]; Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]; Shavers, Gregory A [Gregory.A.Shavers@wv.gov]; Weekley, Jim K [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov]; Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov]; Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov]	RE: juvenile comp placements	000000002431A47AC42DDE4BA8CC5DF075C07177840C2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001021760	MSG	6/11/2021 11:48	Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov]	Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov];	RE: juvenile comp placements	000000002431A47AC42DDE4BA8CC5DF075C07177A40C2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001021761	MSG	6/11/2021 11:45	Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]	Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov]; Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]; Shavers, Gregory A [Gregory.A.Shavers@wv.gov]; Weekley, Jim K [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov]; Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov]; Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov]	RE: juvenile comp placements	000000002431A47AC42DDE4BA8CC5DF075C07177C40C2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001021762	MSG	6/11/2021 11:43	Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov]	Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov];	RE: juvenile comp placements	000000002431A47AC42DDE4BA8CC5DF075C07177E40C2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to obtaining additional placement options.
CTRL0001021763	MSG	6/11/2021 11:43	Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]	Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov]; Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]; Shavers, Gregory A [Gregory.A.Shavers@wv.gov]; Weekley, Jim K [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov]; Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov]; Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov]	RE: juvenile comp placements	000000002431A47AC42DDE4BA8CC5DF075C07177040D2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to obtaining additional placement options.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0001021764	MSG	6/11/2021 11:32	Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov]	Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]; Shavers, Gregory A [Gregory.A.Shavers@wv.gov]; Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]; Weekley, Jim K [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov]; Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov]; Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov]	RE: juvenile comp placements	000000002431A47AC42DDE4BA8CC5DF075C07177240D2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to obtaining additional placement options.
CTRL0001021765	MSG	6/11/2021 11:10	Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov]	Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov];	RE: juvenile comp placements	000000002431A47AC42DDE4BA8CC5DF075C07177440D2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001021766	MSG	6/11/2021 10:59	Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]	Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov];	RE: juvenile comp placements	000000002431A47AC42DDE4BA8CC5DF075C07177640D2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001021771	MSG	6/8/2021 20:16	Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov]	Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov]; Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]; Shavers, Gregory A [Gregory.A.Shavers@wv.gov]; Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]; Weekley, Jim K [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov]; Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov]	RE: juvenile comp placements	000000002431A47AC42DDE4BA8CC5DF075C07177040F2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001021772	MSG	6/8/2021 19:31	Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov]	Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]; Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov]; Shavers, Gregory A [Gregory.A.Shavers@wv.gov]; Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]; Weekley, Jim K [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov]; Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov]	RE: juvenile comp placements	000000002431A47AC42DDE4BA8CC5DF075C07177240F2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0001042989	MSG	11/18/2019 15:20	Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]	Cole, Janie M [Janie.M.Cole@wv.gov]; Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]; Weekley, Jim K [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov]; Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov]; Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov]; Murphy, Melanie M [Melanie.M.Murphy@wv.gov]; Waugh, Edward S [Edward.S.Waugh@wv.gov]; Boston, Brooke E [Brooke.E.Boston@wv.gov]	QRTP Programs	0000000061E5948E69751649B153B59D24C16B4EA4102000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001043885	MSG	6/23/2021 15:30	Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Harper, Erica B [Erica.B.Harper@wv.gov]; Grogg, Heather M [Heather.M.Grogg@wv.gov]; Queen, Amanda D [Amanda.D.Queen@wv.gov];	RE: Position Description Forms	00000000DCF99091F1523D42AB495850364AAD1E4002000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001044242	MSG	6/23/2021 14:16	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]	Harper, Erica B [Erica.B.Harper@wv.gov]; Grogg, Heather M [Heather.M.Grogg@wv.gov]; Queen, Amanda D [Amanda.D.Queen@wv.gov]; Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov]	RE: Position Description Forms	00000000DCF99091F1523D42AB495850364AAD1E48A2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001044242.0001	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	9696 - Youth Residential Worker 1.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001044242.0002	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	9697 - Youth Residential Worker 2.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.
Defendants' Privilege Log
1/10/2024

Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001046842	MSG	5/16/2019 8:18	Holt, Pamela M [Pamela.M.Holt@wv.gov]	Cole, Janie M [Janie.M.Cole@wv.gov];Henson, Kevin M [Kevin.M.Henson@wv.gov];Hymes, Amy L [Amy.L.Hymes@wv.gov];Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov];O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov];Richards, Susan M [Susan.M.Richards@wv.gov];Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov];Watts, Linda [Linda.M.Watts@wv.gov];Weekley, Jim K [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov];	FW: Proposed Revisions to Supervisor/Manager Training Program (DOP-P18)	00000000BEECF980B9E1B04BA3EB64EB7CD07220840E2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001046842.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	DOP Policy - Supervisor Mgr Training Revised_051319.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001046842.0002	JPG	N/A	N/A	N/ABarno, Laura S	N/A	image003.jpg	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001049782	MSG	1/30/2020 13:24	Dean, Traci A [Traci.A.Dean@wv.gov]	[Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov];Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov];Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov];Fortney, Christie A [Christie.A.Fortney@wv.gov];Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov];Swartz, Rebecca A [Rebecca.A.Swartz@wv.gov];Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov];Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov];Richards, Shannon [shannon.richards@optum.com];Lester, Duane M [Duane.M.Lester@wv.gov];Mercer, Lesa D [Les.D.Mercer@wv.gov];Lindley, Stephanie L [Stephanie.L.Lindley@wv.gov];Dillon, Jason I [Jason.I.Dillon@wv.gov];Cook, Tommie J	FW: Emailing: Draft QRTM Management Report Template	00000000697EA5331BD5CE49BEC56688012D361464952000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001049782.0001	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Draft Q RTP Management Report Template.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001050350	MSG	6/11/2021 9:32	Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov]	Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov];	RE: Future State	0000000010EE1E9A530E1A47B7678E74368FED0A44452000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to care of parenting youth.
CTRL0001050351	MSG	6/11/2021 9:19	Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov]	Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov];	RE: Future State	0000000010EE1E9A530E1A47B7678E74368FED0A64452000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001050352	MSG	6/11/2021 8:54	Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov]	Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]; Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov];	Future State	0000000010EE1E9A530E1A47B7678E74368FED0A84452000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001050593	MSG	2/7/2020 8:25	Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov]	Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Waugh, Edward S [Edward.S.Waugh@wv.gov]; Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov];	RE: Burlington Q RTP	0000000010EE1E9A530E1A47B7678E74368FED0AE4722000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001050615	MSG	1/27/2020 11:57	Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov]	Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov];	RE: Q RTP	0000000010EE1E9A530E1A47B7678E74368FED0A64762000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001060914	MSG	7/12/2021 15:14	Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]	Bush, Jeffrey L [Jeffrey.L.Bush@wv.gov]; Weekley, Jim K [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov];	New Jersey's Residential Rate Setting Methodology	000000001A4E01B0EABDC849AD5210CC1FD9753F643B2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to methods for rate setting.

CTRL0001060 914.0001	XLS	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Rate Setting.xls	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to methods for rate setting.
-------------------------	-----	-----	-----	-----	-----	------------------	--------------------------------------	---

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001071 725	MSG	4/9/2021 15:24	Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]	Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov];Ball, Jessica L [Jessica.L.Ball@wv.gov];An nie Messinger [AMessinger@berrydunn.co m];	RE: Over-assess or over-diagnose?	00000000C49B9 56A05D45A4FA 7285D531AED37 D6C4072000.MSG G	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to assessment of mental health conditions.
CTRL0001071 726	MSG	4/9/2021 15:21	Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M .BertelliCole man@wv.go v]	Ball, Jessica L [Jessica.L.Ball@wv.gov];Bar no, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov];An nie Messinger [AMessinger@berrydunn.co m];	RE: Over-assess or over-diagnose?	00000000C49B9 56A05D45A4FA 7285D531AED37 D6E4072000.MSG G	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001072 708	MSG	9/24/2019 11:18	Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]	Boley-Rogers, Kendra F [Kendra.F.Boley- Rogers@wv.gov];Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov];Be rtelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman @wv.gov];Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov];	RE: CAPS for Q RTP	0000000084D57F B76D91AB48B5 00922EB825E7B 844772000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of CAPS policy.
CTRL0001072 719	MSG	9/24/2019 10:46	Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M .BertelliCole man@wv.go v]	Boley-Rogers, Kendra F [Kendra.F.BoleyRogers@wv.gov];Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov];De an, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov]; Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov];	RE: CAPS for Q RTP	0000000084D57F B76D91AB48B5 00922EB825E7B 8A4782000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of CAPS policy.
CTRL0001072 722	MSG	9/24/2019 10:29	Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]	Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman @wv.gov];Boley-Rogers, Kendra F [Kendra.F.Boley- Rogers@wv.gov];Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov]; Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov];	RE: CAPS for Q RTP	0000000084D57F B76D91AB48B5 00922EB825E7B 804792000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of CAPS policy.

CTRL0001074 490	MSG	8/3/2021 12:55	Lauren Hatcher Trovato [lhatchertrovato@berrydunn.com]	Carla Harper [carla.j.harper@wv.gov];Bole y-Rogers, Kendra F [kendra.f.boleystrogers@wv.gov];Mary James [mjames@berrydunn.com];Li sa Roberts [lisa.roberts@berrydunn.com ];Laura.S.Barno [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov];Th omas Laba [tlaba@berrydunn.com];Shell y Schram [sschram@berrydunn.com];C ummings, Heather D [Heather.D.Cummings@wv.gov];	TFC Workgroup (weekly)	0000000084D57F B76D91AB48B5 00922EB825E7B 8E48C2100.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
--------------------	-----	----------------	--	--	---------------------------	--	--	---

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001074 490.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20210804_Agend a_TFC_Workgro up.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001074 495	MSG	7/23/2021 11:04	Lauren Hatcher Trovato [lhatchertrovato@berrydunn.com]	Carla Harper [carla.j.harper@wv.gov];Bole y-Rogers, Kendra F [kendra.f.boleystrogers@wv.gov];Mary James [mjames@berrydunn.com];Li sa Roberts [lisa.roberts@berrydunn.com ];Laura.S.Barno [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov];Th omas Laba [tlaba@berrydunn.com];	RE: TFC Workgroup (weekly)	0000000084D57F B76D91AB48B5 00922EB825E7B 8C48E2100.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001074 495.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20210721_Notes _TFC_Workgrou p.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0001074500	MSG	7/16/2021 11:44	Lauren Hatcher Trovato [lhatchertrovato@berrydunn.com]	heather.d.cummings@wv.gov; Carla Harper [carla.j.harper@wv.gov]; Laura S. Barno [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Parsons, Cynthia A [Cynthia.A.Parsons@wv.gov]; Boley-Rogers, Kendra F [kendra.f.boleyrogers@wv.gov]; ckeltnr@kvc.org; kneophytou@kvc.org; rellenberg@nyap.org; lmcullen@nyap.org; plewis@nyap.org; tkuth@nyap.org; Brent Lemon [blemon@kvc.org]; Lisa Roberts [lisa.roberts@berrydunn.com]; Thomas Laba [tlaba@berrydunn.com]	[External] TFC/CSEDW Provider Meeting Notes	0000000084D57FB76D91AB48B500922EB825E7B824902100.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001074500.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20210630_Notes_TFC_Stakeholder_Meeting.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001074500.0001.0001	PPTX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Microsoft_PowerPoint_Presentation.pptx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001074500.0002	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20210707_Notes_TFC_Stakeholder_Meeting.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.



CTRL0001074 500.0002.0001	PPTX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Microsoft_Power Point_Presentation.pptx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001074 500.0003	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20210623_Notes _TFC_Stakeholder _Meeting.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001074 510	MSG	1/28/2021 16:36	Simone Zuchowski [szuchowski@berrydunn.com]	Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov;Kendra.F.Boley-Rogers@wv.gov;Annie Messinger [AMessinger@berrydunn.com];Mary James [mjames@berrydunn.com];Kristen Bickford [kbickford@berrydunn.com];Tennis, Nikki A [Nikki.A.Tennis@wv.gov];Toliver, Cassandra L [Cassandra.L.Toliver@wv.gov];Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov];	[External] RE: TFC Workgroup (weekly)	0000000084D57FB76D91AB48B500922EB825E7B804932100.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001074 510.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20210127_Notes _TFC_Workgroup _Meeting (002).docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0001074 626	MSG	12/18/2020 12:10	Simone Zuchowski [szuchowski@berrydunn.com]	Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov;Ken dra.F.Boley-Rogers@wv.gov;Annie Messinger [AMessinger@berrydunn.com];Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov];Ma ry James [mjames@berrydunn.com];Ki rsten Bickford [kbickford@berrydunn.com];	[External] TFC Workgroup (weekly)	RE: B76D91AB48B5 00922EB825E7B 804BA2100.MSG G	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of meeting notes reflecting internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of therapeutic foster care program.
CTRL0001074 626.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20201216_Notes _TFC_Workgrou p_Meeting.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Meeting notes reflecting internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of therapeutic foster care program.
CTRL0001074 669	MSG	5/4/2020 11:44	Annie Messinger [AMessinger@berrydunn.com]	Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov];Ke ndra.F.Boley-Rogers@wv.gov;Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov];Br ady Birdsong [bbirdsong@berrydunn.com];	RE: TFC Workgroup Meeting (DOJ)	0000000084D57F B76D91AB48B5 00922EB825E7B 824C02100.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of meeting notes reflecting internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of therapeutic foster care program.
CTRL0001074 669.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20200429_Notes _TFC_Workgrou p_Meeting.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Meeting notes reflecting internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of therapeutic foster care program.
CTRL0001075 377	MSG	9/29/2021 16:27	Lauren Hatcher Trovato [lhatchertrovato@berrydunn.com]	Carla Harper [carla.j.harper@wv.gov];Bole y-Rogers, Kendra F [kendra.f.boleystrogers@wv.gov];Laura.S.Barno [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov];Th omas Laba [tlaba@berrydunn.com];Anna Koehle [anna.koehle@berrydunn.com];Michelle Weaver [mweaver@berrydunn.com]; Lisa Roberts [lisa.roberts@berrydunn.com]; rachel.a.goff@wv.gov;	RE: TFC Implementation Plan Follow-up	0000000084D57F B76D91AB48B5 00922EB825E7B 8443F2200.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of meeting notes reflecting internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of therapeutic foster care program.
CTRL0001075 377.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20210927_Notes _TFC_Workgrou p_IP_Discussion.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Meeting notes reflecting internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of therapeutic foster care program.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0001075 382	MSG	9/27/2021 11:26	Lauren Hatcher Trovato [lhatchertrovato@berrydunn.com]	Carla Harper [carla.j.harper@wv.gov];Bole y-Rogers, Kendra F [kendra.f.boleystrogers@wv.gov];Laura.S.Barn no [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov];Cu mmings, Heather D [Heather.D.Cummings@wv.g ov];Thomas Laba [tlaba@berrydunn.com];Anna Koehle [anna.koehle@berrydunn.co m];Michelle Weaver [mweaver@berrydunn.com]; Lisa Roberts [lisa.roberts@berrydunn.com ]; rachel.a.goff@wv.gov	RE: TFC Workgroup DOJ Implementation Plan Discussion	0000000084D57F B76D91AB48B5 00922EB825E7B 824422200.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of meeting notes reflecting internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of therapeutic foster care program.
CTRL0001075 382.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20210923_Notes _TFC_Workgrou p_IP_Discussion. docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Meeting notes reflecting internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of therapeutic foster care program.
CTRL0001075 385	MSG	8/17/2021 15:46	Lauren Hatcher Trovato [lhatchertrovato@berrydunn.com]	Carla Harper [carla.j.harper@wv.gov];Bole y-Rogers, Kendra F [kendra.f.boleystrogers@wv.gov];Mary James [mjames@berrydunn.com];Li sa Roberts [lisa.roberts@berrydunn.com ];Laura.S.Barno [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov];Th omas Laba [tlaba@berrydunn.com];Cum mings, Heather D [Heather.D.Cummings@wv.g ov];	TFC Workgroup (weekly)	0000000084D57F B76D91AB48B5 00922EB825E7B 884432200.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001075 385.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20210818_Agend a_TFC_Workgro up.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001075 385.0002	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20210804_Notes _TFC_Workgrou p.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.
Defendants' Privilege Log
1/10/2024

Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001075386	MSG	8/17/2021 11:01	Lauren Hatcher Trovato [lhatchertrovato@berrydunn.com]	Carla Harper [carla.j.harper@wv.gov];Boley-Rogers, Kendra F [kendra.f.boleystrogers@wv.gov];Mary James [mjames@berrydunn.com];Lisa Roberts [lisa.roberts@berrydunn.com];Laura.S.Barno [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov];Thomas Laba [tlaba@berrydunn.com];Cummings, Heather D [Heather.D.Cummings@wv.gov];	TFC Workgroup (weekly)	0000000084D57FB76D91AB48B500922EB825E7B8A4432200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001075386.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20210818_Agenda_TFC_Workgroup.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001075419	MSG	6/9/2021 16:06	Lauren Hatcher Trovato [lhatchertrovato@berrydunn.com]	Carla Harper [carla.j.harper@wv.gov];Mary James [mjames@berrydunn.com];Boley-Rogers, Kendra F [kendra.f.boleystrogers@wv.gov];Lisa Roberts [lisa.roberts@berrydunn.com];Laura.S.Barno [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov];	[External] RE: TFC Provider FAQ	0000000084D57FB76D91AB48B500922EB825E7B8A44F2200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001075419.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20210607_TFC_Provider_FAQs.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001075421	MSG	6/9/2021 16:04	Lauren Hatcher Trovato [lhatchertrovato@berrydunn.com]	Carla Harper [carla.j.harper@wv.gov];Mary James [mjames@berrydunn.com];Boley-Rogers, Kendra F [kendra.f.boleystrogers@wv.gov];Lisa Roberts [lisa.roberts@berrydunn.com];Laura.S.Barno [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov];	[External] TFC Provider FAQ	0000000084D57FB76D91AB48B500922EB825E7B8E44F2200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al., v. Jim Justice, et al.

Defendants' Privilege Log

1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001075421.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/AWV IES Meetings	N/A	20210607_TFC_Provider_FAQs.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001075447	MSG	1/11/2021 10:28	Holstein, Rachel K [rachel.holstein@optum.com]	[wvies_meetings@optum.com]; Van Hoose, Mark A [mark.vanhoose@cgi.com]; Kim, Yuri Y [yuri.kim@cgi.com]; meredith.h.perrine@cgi.com' [meredith.perrine@cgi.com]; Stroyan, Laurie L [laurie.stroyan@cgi.com]; Mar-mie Hudson [mhudson@berrydunn.com]; Crystal Gray' [cgray@berrydunn.com]; Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov' [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Vincent, Patricia A' [Patricia.A.Vincent@wv.gov]; Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov' [Jim.K.Weekley@wv.gov]; TRACIA.DEAN@WV.GOV' [TRACIA.DEAN@WV.GOV]; Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov' [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov]; Christie.B.Spahr@wv.gov' [Christie.B.Spahr@wv.gov]; Kendra.F.Boley-	[External] RE: WV PATH Family First Phase 2 Sessions - Case Services and Placement Configurations for Family First (FF040)	0000000084D57FB76D91AB48B500922EB825E7B884572200.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001075447.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	20210126_WV_FF_INITIATIVE_Discovery_Session_FF040_Agenda.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001075447.0002	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Session FF040 FF Req FFI-027 FFI-030 FFI-028 Configuration Plans.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0001075 447.0003	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Session FF040 FF Req FFI-019 FFI042 Configuration Plans.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001075 447.0004	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Session FF040 FF Req FFI-017 FFI- 018 FFI-044 Configuration Plans.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001075 976	MSG	11/5/2019 7:57	Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]	Boston, Brooke E [Brooke.E.Boston@wv.gov]; Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]; Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov];	RE: Q RTP Question	00000000472A89 823048F44293D3 9A282C08DF970 4062000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001075 977	MSG	11/4/2019 16:16	Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]	Boston, Brooke E [Brooke.E.Boston@wv.gov]; Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov];	RE: Q RTP Question	00000000472A89 823048F44293D3 9A282C08DF972 4062000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001075 978	MSG	11/4/2019 15:38	Boston, Brooke E [Brooke.E.Boston@wv.gov]	Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]; Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov];	RE: Q RTP Question	00000000472A89 823048F44293D3 9A282C08DF974 4062000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001075 979	MSG	11/4/2019 15:22	Boston, Brooke E [Brooke.E.Boston@wv.gov]	Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]; Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov];	RE: Q RTP Question	00000000472A89 823048F44293D3 9A282C08DF976 4062000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al., v. Jim Justice, et al.

Defendants' Privilege Log

1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001075980	MSG	11/4/2019 15:20	Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]	Boston, Brooke E [Brooke.E.Boston@wv.gov]; Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Miller, Terri S [Terri.S.Miller@wv.gov];	RE: Q RTP Question	00000000472A89823048F44293D39A282C08DF9784062000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001089067	MSG	12/13/2019 16:51	Richards, Shannon [shannon.richards@optum.com]	Johnson, Michael [michael.johnson18@optum.com]; Dean, Traci A [Traci.A.Dean@wv.gov]; Fortney, Christie A [Christie.A.Fortney@wv.gov]; Swartz, Rebecca A [Rebecca.A.Swartz@wv.gov]; Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Ramaswamy, Narayanan [narayanan.ramaswamy@optum.com]; Jun R [jun.r@optum.com]; Mekala, Raghuram [raghuram.mekala@optum.com]; Cook, Tommie J [Tommie.J.Cook@wv.gov]; Lester, Duane M [Duane.M.Lester@wv.gov]; Lawrence, Tammy J [Tammy.J.Lawrence@wv.gov]	RE: Under this update methodology RE: Q RTP scenarios	0000000028ACBE13D72FDF479311A7B5C229833944352000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001089708	MSG	3/24/2020 8:28	Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]	Fortney, Christie A [Christie.A.Fortney@wv.gov]; Johnson, Michael [michael.johnson18@optum.com]; Richards, Shannon F [Shannon.F.Richards@wv.gov]; Swartz, Rebecca A [Rebecca.A.Swartz@wv.gov]; Dean, Traci A [Traci.A.Dean@wv.gov]; Lawrence, Tammy J [Tammy.J.Lawrence@wv.gov]	RE: Q RTP question	0000000028ACBE13D72FDF479311A7B5C2298339E4E72000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001089709	MSG	3/23/2020 16:32	Johnson, Michael [michael.johnson18@optum.com]	Fortney, Christie A [Christie.A.Fortney@wv.gov]; Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Richards, Shannon F [Shannon.F.Richards@wv.gov]; Swartz, Rebecca A [Rebecca.A.Swartz@wv.gov]; Dean, Traci A [Traci.A.Dean@wv.gov]; Lawrence, Tammy J [Tammy.J.Lawrence@wv.gov]	RE: Q RTP question	0000000028ACBE13D72FDF479311A7B5C229833904E82000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0001089710	MSG	3/23/2020 16:27	Fortney, Christie A [Christie.A.Fortney@wv.gov]	Johnson, Michael [michael.johnson18@optum.com]; Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Richards, Shannon F [Shannon.F.Richards@wv.gov]; Swartz, Rebecca A [Rebecca.A.Swartz@wv.gov]; Dean, Traci A [Traci.A.Dean@wv.gov]; Lawrence, Tammy J [Tammy.J.Lawrence@wv.gov]	RE: QRTF question	0000000028ACB E13D72FDF4793 11A7B5C229833 924E82000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001089711	MSG	3/23/2020 16:24	Johnson, Michael [michael.johnson18@optum.com]	Fortney, Christie A [Christie.A.Fortney@wv.gov]; Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Richards, Shannon F [Shannon.F.Richards@wv.gov]; Swartz, Rebecca A [Rebecca.A.Swartz@wv.gov]; Dean, Traci A [Traci.A.Dean@wv.gov]; Lawrence, Tammy J [Tammy.J.Lawrence@wv.gov]	RE: QRTF question	0000000028ACB E13D72FDF4793 11A7B5C229833 944E82000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001089713	MSG	3/23/2020 15:59	Johnson, Michael [michael.johnson18@optum.com]	Fortney, Christie A [Christie.A.Fortney@wv.gov]; Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Richards, Shannon F [Shannon.F.Richards@wv.gov]; Swartz, Rebecca A [Rebecca.A.Swartz@wv.gov]; Dean, Traci A [Traci.A.Dean@wv.gov]; Lawrence, Tammy J [Tammy.J.Lawrence@wv.gov]	RE: QRTF question	0000000028ACB E13D72FDF4793 11A7B5C229833 984E82000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001089714	MSG	3/23/2020 15:52	Johnson, Michael [michael.johnson18@optum.com]	Fortney, Christie A [Christie.A.Fortney@wv.gov]; Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Richards, Shannon F [Shannon.F.Richards@wv.gov]; Swartz, Rebecca A [Rebecca.A.Swartz@wv.gov]; Dean, Traci A [Traci.A.Dean@wv.gov]; Lawrence, Tammy J [Tammy.J.Lawrence@wv.gov]	RE: QRTF question	0000000028ACB E13D72FDF4793 11A7B5C229833 9A4E82000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001089715	MSG	3/23/2020 15:51	Fortney, Christie A [Christie.A.Fortney@wv.gov]	Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Johnson, Michael [michael.johnson18@optum.com]; Richards, Shannon F [Shannon.F.Richards@wv.gov]; Swartz, Rebecca A [Rebecca.A.Swartz@wv.gov]; Dean, Traci A [Traci.A.Dean@wv.gov]; Lawrence, Tammy J [Tammy.J.Lawrence@wv.gov]	RE: QRTF question	0000000028ACB E13D72FDF4793 11A7B5C229833 9C4E82000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation regarding federal rule related to QRTF.

Jonathan R., et al., v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description



CTRL0001089716	MSG	3/23/2020 15:49	Johnson, Michael [michael.johnson18@optum.com]	Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Richards, Shannon F [Shannon.F.Richards@wv.gov]; Fortney, Christie A [Christie.A.Fortney@wv.gov]; Swartz, Rebecca A [Rebecca.A.Swartz@wv.gov]; Dean, Traci A [Traci.A.Dean@wv.gov]; Lawrence, Tammy J [Tammy.J.Lawrence@wv.gov]	RE: Q RTP question	0000000028ACB E13D72FDF4793 11A7B5C229833 9E4E82000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001089717	MSG	3/23/2020 15:48	Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]	Johnson, Michael [michael.johnson18@optum.com]; Fortney, Christie A [Christie.A.Fortney@wv.gov]; Richards, Shannon F [Shannon.F.Richards@wv.gov]; Swartz, Rebecca A [Rebecca.A.Swartz@wv.gov]; Dean, Traci A [Traci.A.Dean@wv.gov]; Lawrence, Tammy J [Tammy.J.Lawrence@wv.gov]	RE: Q RTP question	0000000028ACB E13D72FDF4793 11A7B5C229833 904E92000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation regarding federal rule related to Q RTP.
CTRL0001090046	MSG	3/23/2020 15:46	Johnson, Michael [michael.johnson18@optum.com]	Fortney, Christie A [Christie.A.Fortney@wv.gov]; Richards, Shannon F [Shannon.F.Richards@wv.gov]; Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Swartz, Rebecca A [Rebecca.A.Swartz@wv.gov]; Dean, Traci A [Traci.A.Dean@wv.gov]; Lawrence, Tammy J [Tammy.J.Lawrence@wv.gov]	RE: Q RTP question	0000000028ACB E13D72FDF4793 11A7B5C229833 9A4912100.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation regarding federal rule related to Q RTP.
CTRL0001100138	MSG	12/19/2019 16:34	Lawrence, Tammy J [Tammy.J.Lawrence@wv.gov]	Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Harper, Carla J [Carla.J.Harper@wv.gov]; Bertelli Coleman, Christina M [Christina.M.BertelliColeman@wv.gov]; Fortney, Christie A [Christie.A.Fortney@wv.gov]; Dean, Michelle C [Michelle.C.Dean@wv.gov]; Swartz, Rebecca A [Rebecca.A.Swartz@wv.gov]; Dean, Traci A [Traci.A.Dean@wv.gov]; Richards, Shannon [shannon.richards@optum.com]; Lester, Duane M [Duane.M.Lester@wv.gov]; Mercer, Lesa D [Lesla.D.Mercer@wv.gov]; Lindley, Stephanie L [Stephanie.L.Lindley@wv.gov]; Dillon, Jason I [Jason.I.Dillon@wv.gov]; Cook, Tommie J [Tommie.J.Cook@wv.gov]	Emailing: Draft Q RTP Management Report Template	00000000D98727 C2191C554DAE 3A670D5A82560 BE4F42600.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0001100138.0001	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Draft Q RTP Management Report Template.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001101446	MSG	1/6/2020 13:07	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]	Barno, Laura S [Laura.S.Barno@wv.gov]; Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov];	RE: Emailing: Draft Q RTP Management Report Template	0000000062FCB378B7CA8D479CF41BCF769DE3E3845E2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001101446.0001	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Draft Q RTP Management Report Template.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001102949	MSG	6/3/2021 13:39	Beckett, Jennifer M [Jennifer.M.Beckett@wv.gov]	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]; Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Whaley, Lance C [Lance.C.Whaley@wv.gov]	RE: Progress on PIP	00000000C40900F0BB873B4BAD36FC71D01917D2241F2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001102950	MSG	6/3/2021 13:13	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]	Beckett, Jennifer M [Jennifer.M.Beckett@wv.gov]; Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Whaley, Lance C [Lance.C.Whaley@wv.gov]	RE: Progress on PIP	00000000C40900F0BB873B4BAD36FC71D01917D2441F2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001102951	MSG	6/3/2021 13:11	Beckett, Jennifer M [Jennifer.M.Beckett@wv.gov]	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]; Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Whaley, Lance C [Lance.C.Whaley@wv.gov]	RE: Progress on PIP	00000000C40900F0BB873B4BAD36FC71D01917D2641F2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.
Defendants' Privilege Log
1/10/2024

Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001102952	MSG	6/3/2021 13:11	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]	Beckett, Jennifer M [Jennifer.M.Beckett@wv.gov]; Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Whaley, Lance C [Lance.C.Whalen@wv.gov]	RE: Progress on PIP	00000000C40900F0BB873B4BAD36FC71D01917D2841F2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001102953	MSG	6/3/2021 13:07	Beckett, Jennifer M [Jennifer.M.Beckett@wv.gov]	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]; Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Whaley, Lance C [Lance.C.Whalen@wv.gov]	RE: Progress on PIP	00000000C40900F0BB873B4BAD36FC71D01917D2A41F2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001102954	MSG	6/3/2021 12:55	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Beckett, Jennifer M [Jennifer.M.Beckett@wv.gov]; Whaley, Lance C [Lance.C.Whalen@wv.gov]	RE: Progress on PIP	00000000C40900F0BB873B4BAD36FC71D01917D2C41F2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001111718	MSG	7/16/2019 17:13	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov];	Crisis SOPs	00000000C0DC4E34FF940E42AD673C0D7F3282D8441F2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001111718.0001	DOC	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Admin. Case Closure SOP w Mel comments.doc	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001111718.0002	DOC	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP Crisis Response with new revisions 712-19 w Mel comments.doc	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001129255	MSG	10/26/2020 10:27	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov];	RE: case closure SOP	0000000056041D83179B274B91515CDE96AE5DD B24282000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of case closure policy.
CTRL0001129255.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP Case Closure Draft 1025-2020 with revisions and comments.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to development of case closure policy.
CTRL0001129256	MSG	10/27/2020 14:22	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov];	RE: case closure SOP	0000000056041D83179B274B91515CDE96AE5DD BA4282000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001129256.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP Case Closure Draft 1027-2020 with revisions and comments.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001132980	MSG	6/3/2021 12:00	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov];	Progress on PIP	00000000397A20D23AF70049996 6A778DE921B74841B2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to data collection process.
CTRL0001132981	MSG	6/1/2021 20:42	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]	Re: Progress on PIP	00000000397A20D23AF70049996 6A778DE921B74241D2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to data collection process.
CTRL0001132982	MSG	6/1/2021 16:30	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov];	RE: Progress on PIP	00000000397A20D23AF70049996 6A778DE921B74441D2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to data collection process.
CTRL0001132983	MSG	6/1/2021 16:04	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov];	Progress on PIP	00000000397A20D23AF70049996 6A778DE921B74641D2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to data collection process.
CTRL0001133016	MSG	10/8/2020 18:09	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov];	RE: case closure SOP	00000000397A20D23AF70049996 6A778DE921B74A43E2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to data collection process.

CTRL0001133017	MSG	10/8/2020 10:42	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov];	RE: case closure SOP	00000000397A20D23AF700499966A778DE921B74843F2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to data collection process.
----------------	-----	-----------------	--	--	----------------------	--	--------------------------------	---

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001133018	MSG	10/8/2020 10:12	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]	Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov];	RE: case closure SOP	00000000397A20D23AF700499966A778DE921B74A43F2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001133210	MSG	10/8/2020 9:16	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]; Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov];	RE: case closure SOP	00000000397A20D23AF700499966A778DE921B7444C72000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001133210.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP Case Closure Draft 107-2020 with revisions and comments TO review.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001136660	MSG	6/23/2021 10:45	Grogg, Heather M [Heather.M.Grogg@wv.gov]	Harper, Erica B [Erica.B.Harper@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Queen, Amanda D [Amanda.D.Queen@wv.gov];	FW: Position Description Forms	000000003EA0B9BF39B2624D97A01F64DD2B95AB04202000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about structure of potential FTEs.
CTRL0001136660.0001	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	9696 - Youth Residential Worker 1.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation about structure of potential FTEs.
CTRL0001136660.0002	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	9697 - Youth Residential Worker 2.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation about structure of potential FTEs.

CTRL0001139495	MSG	10/26/2020 10:21	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]	Bragg, Lorie L (Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov); Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov];	FW: case closure SOP	000000000CA97D36C682FA40B1A93606D9BABFC604072000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about case closure policy.
CTRL0001139495.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP Case Closure Draft 1025-2020 with revisions and comments.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation about case closure policy.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001143899	MSG	7/23/2019 11:59	Heldreth, Beverly S [Beverly.S.Heldreth@wv.gov]	Ellis, Launea J [Launea.J.Ellis@wv.gov]; Casto, Delbert D [Delbert.D.Cast@wv.gov]; Murphy, Barry A [Barry.A.Murphy@wv.gov]; Janes-Ash, Christa M [Christa.M.Janes-Ash@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Lemasters, Cree H [Cree.H.Lemasters@wv.gov];	Fwd: FW:	000000000C8F07A8E7B30F54791B5D329088E751BE49B2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001143899.0001	GIF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	image001.gif	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001143899.0002	HTM	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	ATT00001.htm	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001143899.0003	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Carmichael- OOS Placement Face Sheet 04-10-19.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0001143 899.0004	HTM	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	ATT00002.htm	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
-------------------------	-----	-----	-----	-----	-----	--------------	--------------------------------------	---

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001143 899.0005	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Matthew West OOS Fact Sheet.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001143 899.0006	HTM	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	ATT00003.htm	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001145 932	MSG	6/23/2021 10:52	Harper, Erica B [Erica.B.Harper@wv.gov]	Grogg, Heather M [Heather.M.Grogg@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Queen, Amanda D [Amanda.D.Queen@wv.gov];	RE: Position Description Forms	000000001AAE6 AC447D2C14D9 1116DCBDC3B C78DE40E2000. MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001155 062	MSG	7/23/2019 12:00	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]	Ullom, Paula A [Paula.A.Ullom@wv.gov];	FW: FW:	00000000BA227 57C14C6AC4EB E5114964E54597 A84422000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0001155 062.0001	GIF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	image001.gif	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001155 062.0002	HTM	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	ATT00001.htm	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001155 062.0003	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Carmichael- OOS Placement Face Sheet 04-10-19.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001155 062.0004	HTM	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	ATT00002.htm	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001155 062.0005	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Matthew West OOS Fact Sheet.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.



CTRL0001155 062.0006	HTM	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	ATT00003.htm	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001155 064	MSG	7/22/2019 16:07	O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]	Ullom, Paula A [Paula.A.Ullom@wv.gov];	FW: Crisis SOPs	00000000BA227 57C14C6AC4EB E5114964E54597 AC4422000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to case closure and crisis response policies.
CTRL0001155 064.0001	DOC	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Admin. Case Closure SOP w Mel comments.doc	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to case closure and crisis response policies.
CTRL0001155 064.0002	DOC	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP Crisis Response with new revisions 712-19 w Mel comments.doc	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to case closure and crisis response policies.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001166 128	MSG	6/3/2021 12:55	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]; Beckett, Jennifer M (Jennifer.M.Beckett@wv.gov) [Jennifer.M.Beckett@wv.gov]; Whaley, Lance C [Lance.C.Whalen@wv.gov]	RE: Progress on PIP	00000000BECB D1349EC6F540A 658FBC94441A8 F124832000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001166 511	MSG	10/8/2020 10:14	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]	Bragg, Lorie L [Lorie.L.Bragg@wv.gov]; Mitchell, Tina A [Tina.A.Mitchell@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov];	RE: case closure SOP	00000000BECB D1349EC6F540A 658FBC94441A8 F1441D2100.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation related to case closure and crisis response policies.
CTRL0001166 855	MSG	1/28/2020 12:43	Spencer, Amanda J [Amanda.J.Spencer@wv.gov]	Urquhart, Melanie L [Melanie.L.Urquhart@wv.gov]; Richards, Susan M [Susan.M.Richards@wv.gov]; O'Connell, Tanny W [Tanny.W.OConnell@wv.gov]	RE: FFA Tracks	00000000BECB D1349EC6F540A 658FBC94441A8 F1E49A2100.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Internal, pre-decisional deliberation about use of FFA Tracks.
CTRL0001195 850	MSG	10/4/2023 12:05	Snodgrass, Aaron M [aaron.m.snodgrass@wv.gov]	Bates, Rae J [rae.j.bates@wv.gov];	Re: Pie Chart	0000000077E107 D954F7B542895 4A8448FE39DB9 041C2000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0001195 850.0001	PPTX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	FY2024 Budget.pptx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001195 850.0001.0001	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Microsoft Excel Worksheet.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001195 850.0001.0002	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Microsoft Excel Worksheet1.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001195 850.0002	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	FY2024 Budget Bill for OHF.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0001196680	MSG	10/24/2023 13:52	Wilcox, Starlah A [starlah.a.wilcox@wv.gov]	Matthew Q Christiansen [Matthew.Q.Christiansen@wv.gov]; Justin J Davis [justin.j.davis@wv.gov]; Amy D Atkins [amy.d.atkins@wv.gov]; Donnie W Haynes [donnie.w.haynes@wv.gov]; Danny W Thompson [Danny.W.Thompson@wv.gov]; Mrs. Tara L Buckner [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]; Quinnelly, Laura [laura.quinnelly@wv.gov]; John F Jackson [john.f.jackson@wv.gov]	BPH Improvements/Supplementals submitted	000000005621E4F51D3D6D4191CE1113DCE6CF3CC4222000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001196680.0001	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Supplementals and Improvements Tracking 0506 BPH.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001197231	MSG	9/22/2023 17:31	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]	Cynthia A Persily [cynthia.a.persily@wv.gov]; Starlah A Wilcox [starlah.a.wilcox@wv.gov]	Electronic Copy of Improvements/Supplementals	00000000B13B6B60E834414B857C94384AF9611164032000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al., v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001197231.0001	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Supplementals and Improvements Tracking 0511.xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001197567	MSG	9/6/2023 8:28	Thompson, Danny W [danny.w.thompson@wv.gov]	Justin J Davis [Justin.J.Davis@wv.gov];	Sub-Grants SOPs	00000000AB495C96C6FDF642A47DD213B081D70324072000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0001197 567.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP for Global Grant Summary Reports in CRM.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001197 567.0002	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP for Entering Finance Reports into CRM.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001197 567.0003	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP for EnteringA-1000 into CRM.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001197 567.0004	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP for Finding IN, PRC, PRM, and EFT Numbers in OASIS.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001197 567.0005	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP for Entering Grants into CRM Revised.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0001197 567.0006	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP for Processing Refund Checks.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001197 567.0007	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP for Verifying SAM and SOS for Grants.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001197 567.0008	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP for looking up Grant Refunds- Deposits in Oasis.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001197 567.0009	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP Updating CRM Grant Type.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001197 567.0010	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	~\$P for Adding- ModifyingDeleting CRM users.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0001197 567.0011	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP Monitoring Checklist.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001197 567.0012	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	~\$P for Processing Refund Checks.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001197 567.0013	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Grantee Invoice Memo Dec 2022.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001197 567.0014	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	List of Repetitive Grant Types G220.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001197 567.0015	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP for Adding- ModifyingDeleting CRM users.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0001197 567.0016	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP for Change in Funding Source Change Order Without Exhibit B.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001197 567.0017	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Subrecipient vs Contractor Checklist - USE THIS FORM 3-2021.pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001197 567.0018	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP - SAGA - May 14 2015 - draft (no memo yet).pdf	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001197 567.0019	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP for Creating an MOU.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001197 567.0020	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP for Entering a Change Order into CRM.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0001197 567.0021	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP for Creating Emailing Invoices and ERs to Program Staff.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001197 567.0022	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP for Entering a Close Out Change Order into CRM.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001197 567.0023	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP for Deleting CRM users.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001197 567.0024	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	SOP for Entering Expenditure Reports into CRM.docx	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001197 658	MSG	11/27/2023 12:05	Richards, Susan M [susan.m.rich ards@wv.go v]	Brandon S Stephens [brandon.s.stephens@wv.gov ];	Implementation Science	00000000B5282 A82F616A34D82 FFB52BE9B9047 C44022000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.



CTRL0001197 658.0001	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	NIRN- MonographFull- 01-2005.pdf	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001197 658.0002	PDF	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	ImplementationDrivers- Overview- 1.pdf	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199 503	MSG	10/1/2023 7:54	wvcares@w v.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664 C0AF8D1C45B5 C6E2FC406577B DA4012000.MSG G	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001199 504	MSG	9/30/2023 7:53	wvcares@w v.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664 C0AF8D1C45B5 C6E2FC406577B DC4012000.MSG G	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199 505	MSG	9/29/2023 7:54	wvcares@w v.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664 C0AF8D1C45B5 C6E2FC406577B DE4012000.MSG	Deliberati ve Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0001199 506	MSG	9/28/2023 7:53	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664 C0AF8D1C45B5 C6E2FC406577B D04022000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199 507	MSG	9/27/2023 7:53	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664 C0AF8D1C45B5 C6E2FC406577B D24022000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199 508	MSG	9/26/2023 7:54	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664 C0AF8D1C45B5 C6E2FC406577B D44022000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199 509	MSG	9/25/2023 7:55	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664 C0AF8D1C45B5 C6E2FC406577B D64022000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001199 510	MSG	9/24/2023 8:15	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664 C0AF8D1C45B5 C6E2FC406577B D84022000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

CTRL0001199 511	MSG	9/23/2023 8:17	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664 C0AF8D1C45B5 C6E2FC406577B DA4022000.MSG G	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199 512	MSG	9/22/2023 8:20	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664 C0AF8D1C45B5 C6E2FC406577B DC4022000.MSG G	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199 513	MSG	9/21/2023 8:21	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664 C0AF8D1C45B5 C6E2FC406577B DE4022000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199 514	MSG	9/20/2023 8:19	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664 C0AF8D1C45B5 C6E2FC406577B D04032000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199 515	MSG	9/19/2023 7:55	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664 C0AF8D1C45B5 C6E2FC406577B D24032000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.								
Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description

CTRL0001199 516	MSG	9/18/2023 7:59	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664 C0AF8D1C45B5 C6E2FC406577B D44032000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199 518	MSG	9/17/2023 7:59	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664 C0AF8D1C45B5 C6E2FC406577B D84032000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199 519	MSG	9/16/2023 7:55	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664 C0AF8D1C45B5 C6E2FC406577B DA4032000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199 520	MSG	9/15/2023 7:55	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664 C0AF8D1C45B5 C6E2FC406577B DC4032000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199 521	MSG	9/14/2023 7:54	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664 C0AF8D1C45B5 C6E2FC406577B DE4032000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199 522	MSG	9/13/2023 7:55	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664 C0AF8D1C45B5 C6E2FC406577B D04042000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.
Defendants' Privilege Log
1/10/2024

Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001199523	MSG	9/12/2023 7:57	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664C0AF8D1C45B5C6E2FC406577BD24042000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199524	MSG	9/11/2023 7:59	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664C0AF8D1C45B5C6E2FC406577BD44042000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199525	MSG	9/10/2023 7:57	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664C0AF8D1C45B5C6E2FC406577BD64042000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199526	MSG	9/9/2023 7:56	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664C0AF8D1C45B5C6E2FC406577BD84042000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199527	MSG	9/8/2023 7:56	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664C0AF8D1C45B5C6E2FC406577BDA4042000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199529	MSG	9/7/2023 7:57	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664C0AF8D1C45B5C6E2FC406577BDE4042000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.

Defendants' Privilege Log

1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001199530	MSG	9/6/2023 7:56	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664C0AF8D1C45B5C6E2FC406577BD04052000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199531	MSG	9/5/2023 7:55	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664C0AF8D1C45B5C6E2FC406577BD24052000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199532	MSG	9/4/2023 7:56	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664C0AF8D1C45B5C6E2FC406577BD44052000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199533	MSG	9/3/2023 7:56	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664C0AF8D1C45B5C6E2FC406577BD64052000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199534	MSG	9/2/2023 7:55	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664C0AF8D1C45B5C6E2FC406577BD84052000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001199535	MSG	9/1/2023 7:54	wvcares@wv.gov	melanie.l.urquhart@wv.gov;	WVDHHR Notification: New Background Check Needed	00000000F24664C0AF8D1C45B5C6E2FC406577BDAA4052000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.

Jonathan R., et al. , v. Jim Justice, et al.

Defendants' Privilege Log								
1/10/2024								
Control Number	File Extension	Sent Date/Time	From	Recipient(s) and Copyee(s)	Subject	File Name	Privilege	Description
CTRL0001200134	MSG	10/5/2023 17:59	Buckner, Tara L [tara.l.buckner@wv.gov]	Cynthia A Persily [cynthia.a.persily@wv.gov]; Starlah A Wilcox [starlah.a.wilcox@wv.gov]	AR1 Impact Statement	0000000013FEFF065FBC4A478A3537D46FEE8BD0E4072000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001200134.0001	DOCX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	0511 AR1 draft Sec comments (1) updated 10052023.docx	Deliberative Process Privilege	Attached to or family member of a document that received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001204431	MSG	9/15/2023 12:31	Parks, Rick L [rick.l.parks@wv.gov]	Laurea J Ellis [laurea.j.ellis@wv.gov]; Paula A Ullom [paula.a.ullom@wv.gov];	Assessment reviews	000000008E4E3ECE6A942846B7A7231FB53C2E35C4032000.MSG	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.
CTRL0001204431.0001	XLSX	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Manager IA Reviews - Blank Form (1).xlsx	Deliberative Process Privilege	This document received a score greater than or equal to the cutoff score generated by Relativity's predictive coding tool for deliberative process privilege, which is developed in part through the results of a manual review by Defendants' counsel of thousands of ESI documents for this case.